VILLAGE OF CHAGRIN FALLS
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD MINUTES
November 7, 2017

Members present: Barclay, Clemens, King, Koepf, Naylor.

Also Present: Edwards, Jamieson, Law Director Markowitz

Meeting called to order at: 8:30 AM

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion by Naylor, second by King to approve October 3 meeting minutes. Motion passed.

Motion by King, second by Barclay to approve October 17 meeting minutes. Motion passed.

The following minutes are a summation of comments and discussions relative to each agenda item, rather than a full recitation, due to the length of the meeting.

1. Strauss 23 Water Street Demolition- Tabled

A Public Meeting was opened and those wishing to speak were sworn in by Law Director Dale Markowitz.

Attorney Jordan Berns, representing owner Susan Strauss, summarized documentation presented to the Board.

Motion by King that Board received Sinopoli Brothers Construction (SBC) and Cleveland Restoration Society (CRS) reports regarding estimated cost and economic feasibility of rehabilitating the historic portion of the 23 Water Street house, second by Naylor. Motion passed.

Mr. John Sinopoli with SBC, contractor for the owner, summarized his written report previously submitted to the Board.

No one was present from CRS.

Motion by Naylor that Board received appraisals of Andrew Leirer and Charles Dudas, second by King. Motion passed.

Mr. John Sinopoli of SBC stated in his opinion the CRS figures were too low and that his estimate took into account various scenarios such as replacement of the foundation, and lead abatement which would not be known until the building was further investigated. He stated there was standing water in the basement. Mr. Sinopoli is not a structural engineer and cannot make a determination on the condition of the foundation. Sinopoli stated that he felt the CRS window estimate was too low based on inquiries with a recommended window manufacturer. There was discussion of lead and mold issues with no expert testimony presented. The SBC estimate calculated renovations at $630/sq.ft. Clemens and Koepf presented contrary opinions stating that they felt the CRS estimate was reasonable and that some of the proposed work may not be necessary, further dropping the cost estimate. CRS estimate calculated renovations at $272/sq.ft. In the opinion of Clemens and Koepf, the SBC estimate was too high.

Koepf and Naylor pointed out that the gutters have remained disconnected to downspouts and no climate control (heat or dehumidifier) has been in the building since owner took possession, creating potential for water damage and aggravation of a known prior mold issue.

Naylor expressed opinion that appraiser comparables did not reflect the fair market value (FMV) of houses located in the Chagrin Falls West Side Historic District. She presented several examples of recent sales at $331, $272 and $245 per sq. ft., which are significantly greater than the estimates given by both appraiser reports and would make the CRS cost estimate economically feasible. She further pointed out that the 23 Water house is part of a larger ca. 2,800 sq.ft. home and should be compared to houses of that size when calculating FMV.

Appraisers Charles Dudas and Andrew Leirer both presented and reviewed their reports with the Board.

The Strausses purchased the house in March 2017 "as is" for $375,000 with no inspection. They were presented with a mold remediation certificate and warranty from the previous owner. There were other competing offers. Mrs. Strauss stated that she was told that the house had "a small flood in the winter", but was not aware until after closing that the flood was composed of 7,000-10,000 gallons of water. She said the house has bubbling and peeling lead paint.

At the request of Mr. Berns, Mrs. Strauss stated that she did not intend to demolish the house at the time of purchase, and did not neglect the house under her ownership with intent to demolish, and that the condition of the house has not changed since she took ownership.

Mrs. Strauss stated that the mold warranty presented by previous owner was limited to defined areas of the house. She stated she has done everything she can to make the house feasible and healthy to live in, but the mold is a huge issue based on the opinion of other mold experts she has had to the house.

Mr. King stated that it appears that the Strausses did not have an inspection because they knew it would fail.

Mr. Leirer testified that the house appeared neglected due to sistered beams and exterior siding needing work, but did not see any evidence of gross neglect.

Mrs. Naylor pointed out that the 1845 Greek Revival house is one of the oldest, if not the oldest house in the village located at the center of the historic district and has retained architectural integrity. Demolition of this house would affect the value of surrounding historic properties by impacting the historic fabric of the district with introduction of a new house.

Clemens pointed out that the Board has tried to work with the Strausses asking them to retain the historic 927 sq. ft. front west portion of the house and then propose a new addition to the rear. The Strausses have never presented plans showing this scenario.

Members of the public were invited to speak:

Doug Leary, 56 Water Street – The Learys have lived on Water Street for 30 years and have spent the money to restore their 1875 Victorian house which they bought in run down condition. The houses on

either side of them are dated 1876 and pre-Civil War. Water Street is the most historic street in Chagrin Falls. The Learys bought in the Village because of the quality of life. The historic district houses are not comparable to houses in other parts of the Village. The King house at 96 Maple was renovated and recently sold.

Karen Leary, 56 Water Street - She feels ARB understands integrity and that the Strauss's may have buyers' remorse. She requested that the Village be sure that neglect of house does not continue.

Nicole Paolozzi, 29 Water Street - It is the in the spirit of the Village Code to save the house from demolition. Allowing demolition reduces the value of surrounding houses in the neighborhood. and in the district. There are only so many historic homes left. There are plenty of areas left to build elsewhere. It may cost $300/sq. ft. to renovate, but that is the price of a beautiful home in the historic district. Paolozzis purchased their home – a small house in the Village - because they wanted to be part of the historic fabric so they paid the premium. She has been in the 23 Water Street house and said the front part is fine, the flood was in the back of the house.

Beth Skeel – Chagrin Falls Historical Society – This is a very historic home and featured as part of the CF Historical Society Historic Home Walking Tour. She encouraged the ARB to make every effort to retain this historic home.

Karl Maersch – 100 Church Street - He does not think the appraisals have presented reasonable figures and states that if we are going to allow demolition, we at least need credible data. The houses presented are not comparable. He feels the Strausses have a great canvas to work with and just need some creativity. He feels actual costs may even be less than CRS estimate and that further detail is needed.

The Board and Law Director moved to Executive Session.

Motion by Naylor to table the demolition of 23 Water Street and continue with public hearing; asking that appraisers revisit their reports focusing on comparable houses ca. 2,800 sq. ft. in size located within the Chagrin Falls West Side Historic District for purposes of determining cost/sq. ft., including valuation of the balance of the house being restored using Chagrin Falls standards. In addition, ask Cleveland Restoration Society to further clarify and detail their estimates assuming reasonable construction costs, i.e. are overhead & construction management included in costs? are complete systems included? Second by Barclay. Motion passed

2. Weingart 231 East Washington Street Addition – Final Approval

The Historical Significance Report (HSR) dated 11/1/17 as prepared by Mr. Sande states that the existing house does not meet the standards for historical significance as defined by Village Code. Mr. Sande states that the proposed changes to the house would not cause an adverse effect to the historic significance of the property and to proximately located historically significant buildings.

Motion that Historic Significance Report was reviewed and accepted by Naylor, second by King. Motion passed.

rear sunroom windows be more in keeping with double hung windows. Plans were met with positive comment as an improvement to the house.

Motion by Naylor for Final Approval of plans as presented with rear quad of windows more consistent with double hung windows, second by King. Motion passed

3. Dougherty **66 Hall Street** **Garage Demolition – Approval**
New Detached Garage – Preliminary Approval

The Historical Significance Report (HSR) dated 10/31/17 as prepared by Mr. Sande states that the existing detached garage does not meet the standards for historical significance as defined by Village Code. Mr. Sande states that the proposed demolition of the garage would not cause an adverse effect to the historic significance of the property and to proximately located historically significant buildings.

Motion that Historic Significance Report was reviewed and accepted by King, second by Naylor. Motion passed.

Contractor Jason Carol, Daugherty Construction presented plans for detached garage to allow for improved garage placement for entry and back yard use. Clemens suggested addition of windows to the garage. Fire resistant construction may determine final siding selection, such as Hardie board. Clemens further discouraged vinyl siding.

Motion by King for Preliminary Approval with revision of plans as presented, second by Naylor. Motion passed.

4. Nob Hill Condominium Association 5014 Nob Hill **Detached Garage- Final Approval**

Architect John Peterson, RSA presented plans which have been conditionally approved by BZA with preliminary approval from ARB. Plans were met with positive comment from the Board.

Motion by King for Final Approval of plans as presented, second by Naylor. Motion passed.

WALK-IN

Latour **145 Cleveland Street**

Designer Marc Graham and Owner Krista Latour presented plans for alterations to dormers. Owner was encouraged to retain dormers facing Columbus and Cleveland Streets. The garage addition would be a later phase.

Adjourned at 11:53 AM

11/20/17

Robert Barclay, Chairman Date