VILLAGE OF CHAGRIN FALLS ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD MINUTES August 23, 2017

Members present: Barclay, Clemens, King, Koepf, Naylor

Also Present: Edwards

Meeting called to order at: 8:30 AM

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion by Naylor, second by Barclay to approve August 1 meeting minutes. Motion passed.

1. Trinetti 290 Falls Walk Preliminary Approval

Architect Rick Siegfried and Owners Mr. & Mrs Trinetti presented plans for a new dwelling. Owners are awaiting approval from the Falls Walk Homeowner's Association. The Board discussed site lines, views to the north and east, and organization of the house. The Board recommended making the garage less dominant and front entry more prominent.

Motion by Naylor for Preliminary Approval of plans as presented with revision of front entry, second by King. Motion passed.

2. Firehammer 44 West Washington Street Final Approval

Architect David Jenson and Owner Mr. Firehammer presented plans and photos. Clemmons recommended that façade front dormer be relocated to the east and up to balance the overall composition of the house, and stated that scale of existing garage was in keeping with the surrounding properties.

Motion for Final Approval of plans with redesign of front dormer as presented by Barclay, second by Naylor. Motion passed.

3. Egleston 42 Maple Street Demolition & Final Approval of New Accessory Building

Historical Significance Report (HSR) Addendum #1 dated 8/18/17 as prepared by Mr. Sande states that the existing detached garage meets the standards for historical significance as defined by Village Code. Mr. Sande states that the proposed demolition and replacement with a new detached garage would cause an adverse effect to the historic significance of the property and to proximately located historically significant buildings.

Motion that Historic Significance Report was reviewed and accepted by Naylor, second by King. Motion passed.

A public hearing was held with no comment.

Architect Rebecca Pantuso presented drawings for a new garage which were met with positive comment from the Board. Site inspections of the existing garage by Board members Koepf and Naylor noted removal of the center supporting posts causing the building to collapse inward. Replacement of the center post would limit space and make parking a car impossible.

Motion to approve demolition of existing garage and Final Approval of plans as presented for new garage by Naylor, second by King. Motion passed.

4. Classen

27 Walnut Street

Final Approval - Dormer Addition

Architect Rebecca Pantuso presented plans incorporating Board comments for dormer addition, which were met with positive comment from the Board.

Motion for Final Approval of plans as presented by Naylor, second by King. Motion passed.

5. Brigeman

103 Ridgewood

Preliminary Approval - New Dwelling

Historical Significance Report (HSR) dated 8/17/17 as prepared by Mr. Sande states that the existing house does not meet the standards for historical significance as defined by Village Code. Mr. Sande states that the proposed demolition and replacement with a larger two-story house, garage and free standing barn would not cause an adverse effect to the historic significance of the property and to proximately located historically significant buildings.

Motion that Historic Significance Report was reviewed and accepted by King, second by Naylor. Motion passed.

A public hearing was held with no comment. A letter of support for demolition of the house was submitted by Doug King, 373 East Washington Street.

Architect George Clemens presented plans and photos for a new dwelling house with features influenced by Western Reserve architecture. The Board discussed siting and scale of the house and barn. Koepf stated that the house may be situated on bedrock. Plans were reviewed and met with positive comment from the Board.

Motion for demolition of existing house and Preliminary Approval of plans as presented by Naylor, second by King. Motion passed.

WALK IN

23 Water Street

Architect Joe Matava and Owner Sue Strauss represented by Attorney Jordan Byrnes presented plans for a new dwelling house to replace existing house. Motava described the design as a cottage with proposed 2,000 sq. ft. footprint with no plans to retain the existing historic front portion of the house. Architect and Owner sought comment from the Board in preparation for upcoming demolition request. Clemens stated

that the scale of the design is successful and stylistically presents a traditional design. Naylor stated that the design successfully picks up traditional elements and is compatible with surrounding historic architecture, however retaining the existing historic architecture and materials is always preferable and strongly encouraged.

Firehammer 44 West Washington Street

Garage

Architect David Jenson requested feedback on new garage. Clemmons recommended that scale of existing garage be retained because it is in keeping with the surrounding historic properties.

Adjourned at 9:42 AM

Robert Barclay, Chairman

Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus Historic Preservation Consultant

13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4, Cleveland, OH 44120 tedsande@ameritech.net

MEMORANDUM

Date: 17 August 2017

To: Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls,

Ohio

Subject: 103 Ridgewood Road, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

At the Village's request, as provided in Section 1146.03 (a) (2) paragraphs A and C of Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), I have conducted research on the property at 103 Ridgewood Road to determine its historical significance and reviewed the proposed plans for changes to it with respect to the potential impact that these changes would have upon the historical significance of this property and the immediate neighborhood in which it stands.

Sources Consulted: a) Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online; b) Ohio Historic Inventory (OHI) listings; c) Gray & Pape Photographic Survey; and d) architectural drawings A-1 through A-6 and B-1 prepared by Clemens Pantuso, architects, and provided by the Village Building and Zoning Department. A site visit, and brief meeting with the owner, was made on Wednesday, 16 August 2017.

The Issue: The owner desires to demolish the existing one-story house and attached garage and to replace them with a larger, two-story house and attached garage at the same location. A new, free-standing two-story barn is proposed to be built to the southwest of the house.

Findings:

- 103 Ridgewood Road is located on the west side of the street, the last house before Bell Street, in an R1-100 Residential District. The property is bordered by a deep ravine on its north side.
- There does not appear to be an OHI form for this property and it is not recorded in the Gray & Pape ca. 2005 Photographic Survey. According to the Cuyahoga County Property Information, online, the house and its attached garage were built in 1956.

103 Ridgewood Road, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

- The owner states that the house and garage are prefabricated structures placed on a concrete slab on grade. The house appears to be in fair condition. The house and garage do not possess any unique architectural or historic features.
- The proposed new two-story house, garage and free standing, two-story barn are in a minimal-traditional style that is evident in several of the newer properties on the street.
- This is the fourth property of the dozen or so on this street to come before the ARB in recent years for either demolition and replacement or extensive renovation.

Conclusions and Recommendations: The house and garage at 103 Ridgewood Road does not meet the standards of Historical Significance as defined in Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), Section 1146.05, even though they are more than 50 years old, because: a) they do not possess any unique architectural features; b) they do not appear to be associated with events or persons significant in Village history; and c) they would not be eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places, either individually or as contributing structures within a potential future National Register historic district.

• The proposed demolition of the existing one-story house and garage and their replacement by a larger, two-story house and garage and a new free-standing barn would not cause an adverse effect to their historical significance nor would they cause an adverse effect to proximate historically significant structures.

End of Report

Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus

13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4 Cleveland, Ohio 44120

Tel/Fax: 216-577-6325 email: tedsande@ameritech.net

MEMORANDUM

Date:

18 August 2017

To:

Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls,

Ohio

Subject:

Addendum No. 1: 42 Maple Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

The Issue:

The owner proposes to demolish the existing two-car detached garage and replace it with a new 1 and 1/2 story two car detached garage.

Reference:

a) Historical Significance Report dated 31 January 2017 prepared by Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus. b) Architectural drawings A-1 through A-3 prepared by Clemens Pantuso, architects, and provided by the Village Building and Zoning Department. c) Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online. d) OHI Form CUY717126. e) A site visit was made on Wednesday,

16 August 2017.

Findings:

- The 31 January 2017 historical significance report concluded that the house at 42 Maple Street met the Village's standards of Historical Significance. The report did not address the detached garage.
- According to the Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online, the detached garage dates to 1920, the same year as the house itself. OHI Form CUY 717126 lists, on line 52, the detached garage as a historic outbuilding.
- The proposed new detached garage would closely match the existing detached garage in size and configuration.
- The 42 Maple Street property is located within the boundaries of the Chagrin Falls West Side District, a historic district listed in the National Register of Historic Places. However, it is outside its dates of historical significance, 1845-1900.

Conclusions and Recommendations:

- The existing detached garage meets the Village's standards of Historical Significance as an outbuilding contemporary with the main house. It would qualify as a contributing structure within a proposed future expansion of the historical significance date beyond 1900 of the present NR historic district.
- The demolition of the existing detached garage and its replacement by a new detached garage would cause an adverse effect to the historical significance of the property and to proximate historically significant properties.

End of Addendum

Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus

13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4 Cleveland, Ohio 44120

Tel/Fax: 216-577-6325 email: tedsande@ameritech.net

MEMORANDUM

Date:

18 August 2017

To:

Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls,

Ohio

Subject:

Addendum No. 2: 27 Walnut Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

The Issue:

The owner proposes to add a second floor on the northeast

side of the roof.

Reference:

a) Historical Significance Report dated 12 July 2008 and Addendum No. 1 dated 27 December 2016, both prepared by Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus. b) Architectural drawings A-1 through A-3 prepared by Clemens Pantuso, architects, and provided by the Village Building and Zoning Department. c)

A site visit was made on Wednesday, 16 August 2017.

Findings:

- The 2008 historical significance report determined that 27 Walnut Street is not within
 the boundaries of the Chagrin Falls West Side District, listed in the National Register
 of Historic Places; but, should those boundaries change and should the historical
 significance period of the District be expanded at some future time, the house would
 qualify as a contributing structure within an expanded historic district.
- Addendum No. 1 concluded that the then proposed second floor addition would cause an adverse effect to the historical significance of the property.
- The scope of the proposed second floor addition under the current submittal is smaller and lower in height than what was proposed under Addendum No. 1 in December 2016. The new design is more tightly configured to the original house.

Conclusions and Recommendations:

• The proposed second floor addition would not cause an adverse effect to the historical significance of the house nor to proximate historically significant structures.

End of Addendum



RECEIVED

AUG 2 3 2017

VILLAGE OF CHAGRIN FALLS BUILDING & ZONING DEPT.

FAX: (440) 247-1680

PHONE: (440) 247-4470

August 22, 2017

Village of Chagrin Falls Architectural Review Board Village Hall Chagrin Falls, Ohio 44022

Subject: 103 Ridgewood Road, Chagrin Falls, Ohio, 44022

Ladies and Gentleman:

I've lived at 373 East Washington Street for well over 20 years. The home at 103 Ridgewood Road is directly adjacent to my property. My understanding is that the owners thereof are planning to remove the house currently on the property and replace it with a newly constructed home.

I'm quite familiar with both the property and home now in place. While I haven't seen plans for the new home to be built, in theory I have no objection to the property owners' proposal. Two years ago the house next door was demolished and replaced. I had concerns then that the new home would impair the character of my woods adjacent thereto with invasive lighting, or otherwise. I have those same concerns about the current proposal. As it turned out, the exterior lighting installed does not spill over. The house itself turned out to be a distinct improvement upon its predecessor. Though bigger, it fits well on the lot and is otherwise a pleasant upgrade. I'd like to think that the removal and replacement project proposed for 103 Ridgewood will also prove to be equally acceptable.

I thank you for your consideration.

1

Douglas A. King

Vith sincere regard,