# VILLAGE OF CHAGRIN FALLS ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD MINUTES March 7, 2017

Members present: Barclay, Clemens, King, Koepf, Naylor.

Also Present: Edwards

Meeting called to order at: 8:30 AM

## **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

Motion by Naylor, second by King to approve February 21 meeting minutes. Motion passed.

#### 1. Oscar Giovanni Salon

29 South Main Street

Signage - Final Approval

Owner Oscar Giovanni presented photographs and drawings for proposed sign which were met with positive comment from the Board.

Motion for Final Approval of proposed sign as presented by Naylor, second by King.

#### 2. Sample

**164 Bradley Street** 

**Final Approval with Condition** 

Architect William Oeflein and Applicant-Owner Roger Sample presented plans and photographs for house addition and alterations incorporating Board comments from 2/7/17 ARB meeting. Front elevation first floor windows were retained with a paired window to the north and relocation of door slightly to the south to maintain character defining features of house; and, rear elevation porch re-designed as screened-in with no windows. Board asked that rear elevation porch be slightly set back to the north to leave vertical trim on rear elevation exposed, and for porch posts to be more defined with addition of trim to tie in vertically with the house. The north elevation fireplace doghouse was rejected as not compatible with the historic character of the house. Owner was asked to revise and resubmit doghouse design in keeping with the proportion and scale of the house and suggested a bay window for inspiration.

Motion for Final Approval of plans as presented incorporating comments from Board and conditioned on revision and resubmittal of fireplace dog house design by Naylor, second by King. Motion passed.

#### 3. Sluder

358 Hickory Hill

**Preliminary Approval** 

Historical Significance Report (HSR) dated 3/2/17 as prepared by Mr. Sande states that house at 358 Hickory Hill does not meet the standards for historical significance as defined by Village Code. Mr. Sande states that in his opinion the proposed addition would not have an adverse effect.

Motion that Historic Significance Report was reviewed and accepted by Naylor, second by King. Motion passed.

Architect Rebecca Pantuso presented plans and photographs for construction of addition. The Board and Building Inspector had the following comments and suggestions: (i) remove cultured stone; (ii) investigate sump pump functionality and tie into ditch, not sanitary sewer; and, (iii) investigate downspouts and water movement. Architect offered that owner would like to use Hardie board siding instead of vinyl on addition, in hopes of re-doing all vinyl siding on the house at a later date.

Motion for Preliminary Approval of the plans as presented with Board comments and suggestions by Barclay, second by King. Motion passed.

Adjourned at 9:15 AM

Robert Barclay, Chairman

# Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus Historic Preservation Consultant

13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4, Cleveland, OH 44120 tedsande@ameritech.net

#### **MEMORANDUM**

Date:

2 March 2017

To:

Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls,

Ohio

Subject:

358 Hickory Hill Road, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

At the Village's request, as provided in Section 1146.03 (a) (2) paragraphs A and C of Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), I have conducted research on the property at 358 Hickory Hill Road to determine its historical significance and reviewed the proposed plans for changes to it with respect to the potential impact that these changes would have upon the historical significance of this property and the immediate neighborhood in which it stands.

Sources Consulted: a) Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online; b) Ohio Historic Inventory (OHI) listings; c) Gray & Pape Photographic Survey; and d) architectural drawings A-1, A-4 and A-5, showing a site plan, elevations and details prepared by Clemens Pantuso, Architects, provided by the Village Building and Zoning Department. A site visit was made on Tuesday, 28 February 2017.

The Issue: The owner desires to build a one-story addition at the northeast corner of the house.

## Findings:

- 358 Hickory Hill Road is located on the east side of the street, four lots south of the road's turn-around, in an R1-100 Residential District.
- There are 36 houses on this cul-de-sac. The majority appear to date to the Village's post World War II housing boom of the late 1940s and 1950s. Using the terminology of McAlester's A Field Guide to American Houses, there is a mix of Ranch, Minimal Traditional and Split Level designs. A large Colonial Revival house stands near Walters Road and a large Neoeclectic house has been built within the past ten years at the north end of the cul-de-sac, replacing an early Modernist house. Many of these houses have

been added to or otherwise modified, including at least one with a wood handicap access ramp, since they were originally built.

- I could not find an OHI form for this property and it is not included in the Gray & Pape Photographic Survey. According to the Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online, this one-story, wood-frame Ranch house with its attached two-car garage was built in 1958. It appears from the Cuyahoga County Auditor's information, that the house has been added to on its east side over time. The property appears to be in good condition.
- The proposed addition at the northeast corner of the existing house would not be visible from Hickory Hill Road.

Conclusions and Recommendations: The house at 358 Hickory Hill Road does not meet the standards of Historical Significance as defined in Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), Section 1146.05 because: a) although it is more than 50 years old, it is not listed in the National Register of Historic Places nor would it be eligible for listing either individually or as a contributing structure within a future National Register historic district; b) the property does not appear to be associated with persons or events significant in Village history; and c) the property does not possess high artistic values.

- The proposed northeast addition to the existing house would not cause an adverse effect to its historical significance.
- The proposed northeast addition to the existing house would not cause an adverse effect to proximate historically-significant properties.

**End of Report**