

garage be retained; and that shed roof dormer on west elevation be re-studied. Mr. Barclay requested that addition reflect characteristics of the existing house.

Motion to accept Historic Significance Report by Barclay, second by Naylor. Motion passed.

Motion to re-study and re-submit drawings by Barclay, second by Naylor. Motion passed.

3. CPD Realty 262 South Franklin Addition – Preliminary- Revise & Resubmit

Applicants John Rakauskas and David Dickson presented revised drawings based on June 7 and July 5 ARB meeting comments. Mr. Clemens and Mr. Koepf requested that plans be adjusted for consistency in drawings reflecting roof overhangs to match; the addition of windows on north and south elevations; and consideration of clipped rear roof design. Mr. Edwards requested resubmittal of complete set of construction documents for architect review.

Motion to re-study and re-submit drawings by Barclay, second by Naylor. Motion passed.

Adjourned at 9:50 am

_____ **B-2-14**
Robert Barclay, Chairman Date

Mayor Bill Tomko announced a tour of the former Ivex plant at 215 North Cleveland Street on August 2 at 5:00 pm.

Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus
Historic Preservation Consultant
13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4, Cleveland, OH 44120
tedsande@ameritech.net

MEMORANDUM

Date: 7 June 2016

To: Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls, Ohio

Subject: 97-99 Bell Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

At the Village's request, as provided in Section 1146.03 (a) (2) paragraphs A and C of Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), I have conducted research on the property at 97-99 Bell Street to determine its historical significance and reviewed the proposed plans for changes to it with respect to the potential impact that these changes would have upon the historical significance of this property and the immediate neighborhood in which it stands.

Sources Consulted: a) Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online; b) Cuyahoga County Archives Real Estate Appraisal Files; c) Ohio Historic Inventory (OHI) listings; d) Chagrin Falls Historical Society Archives; e) Gray & Pape Photographic Survey; and f) an 11-page survey of the immediate neighborhood prepared by the property owner and provided by the Village Building and Zoning Department. A site visit was made on Thursday, 30 June 2016.

The Issue: The owner desires to re-clad the existing two-story, wood-frame building with vinyl siding and change the windows from wood to vinyl and wood with triple track storm sash, aluminum window casings, fascias and soffits.

Findings:

- 97-99 Bell Street is the second lot east of the intersection of Bell and Vincent Streets in an R1-50 Residential District. The property is a long, narrow lot that extends from Bell Street north to Vincent.
- There does not appear to be an OHI form for this property, nor is it included in the Gray & Pape Photographic Survey. The Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online, dates the house to 1875. However, based on the Cuyahoga County Archives Real Estate Appraisal Records and the Dr. Elizabeth Rodgers Collection, which

97-99 Bell Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

contains detailed deed transcripts for Chagrin Falls historical properties, 1885 is the probable date of the two-story, wood-frame core of the present house with its gable roof facing Bell Street. A deed recorded on 28 April 1885 confirms the sale of this property to Isaac Burt from William and Mary Hutchings. The 1892 Village Map shows what appears to be the 1885 house and identifies it as "I. Burt", a single family residence.

- The 1858 and 1878 Village Maps and the 1883 Panoramic View of Chagrin Falls show various structures in this vicinity but nothing conclusive that fits the core of the present house at 97-99 Bell Street, due in part to the earlier, later superseded, lot configurations.
- The Cuyahoga County Real Estate Appraisal Records for 93 Bell and 97-99 Bell Street from 1945 and 1954-59, were stapled together since both properties were then owned by a David and Margaret Elliot.
- According to the information contained in the 1945 Appraisal Record, the core of the present house was built in 1885. In 1920, a large, two-story wood-frame addition was constructed on the north side and a two-story front porch on the south side facing Bell Street and the single family house was transformed into a two-family residence, one apartment per floor. At the same time, a second floor wood porch and an iron fire stair were installed on the northwest side to provide secondary egress from the upper floor apartment. A second front door was added to the ground floor porch that serves as the main entrance to the second floor apartment. This is the configuration that exists today. The exterior appears to be in fair to poor condition from deferred maintenance.
- The use of synthetic sidings has a long history in Chagrin Falls, dating back to asbestos shingles, which appeared in the 1930s; aluminum and vinyl simulated clapboard and shingles, which became popular in the latter half of the 20th century; and, more recently cement fiber materials, such as hardie board, that can replicate wood sidings. All have been used in Chagrin Falls over the past 80 years. As outlined in previous historical significance reports where synthetic sidings are proposed, the key questions are: 1) What is the true condition of the existing wood siding and is it necessary to replace it? 2) What are the physical properties of the proposed synthetic material; how durable is it? 3) How will the synthetic siding be installed, including type of insulation, corner treatments, abutting window and door frames, weatherproofness and protection of the wood surfaces covered to avoid further deterioration? The answers to these questions will determine whether or not a synthetic siding is appropriate in any given instance.

97-99 Bell Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

Conclusions and Recommendations: The house at 97-99 Bell Street does not meet the standards of Historical Significance as defined in Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), Section 1146.05 because: a) although it is more than 50 years old, it was radically altered in 1920 and lost its original appearance and configuration; and b) it would not meet the standards for listing in the National Register of Historic Places, either individually or as a contributing structure within a historic district due to its loss of historic fabric and configuration.

- The proposed re-siding of the existing house at 97-99 Bell Street would not have an adverse effect upon its historical significance.
- The proposed re-siding of the existing house at 97-99 Bell Street may have an adverse effect upon proximate historically-significant structures, depending upon the answers to the questions raised above.

End of Report

Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus
Historic Preservation Consultant
13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4, Cleveland, OH 44120
tedsande@ameritech.net

MEMORANDUM

Date: 6 July 2016

To: Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls,
Ohio

Subject: 59 West Washington Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

At the Village's request, as provided in Section 1146.03 (a) (2) paragraphs A and C of Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), I have conducted research on the property at 59 West Washington Street to determine its historical significance and reviewed the proposed plans for changes to it with respect to the potential impact that these changes would have upon the historical significance of this property and the immediate neighborhood in which it stands.

Sources Consulted: a) Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online; b) Ohio Historic Inventory (OHI) listings; c) Gray & Pape Photographic Survey; and d) Plat Survey and architectural drawings ST-1, A-0 through A-3 prepared by Timothy R. Wagner, AIA, NCARB, Architect, provided by the Village Building and Zoning Department. A site visit was made on Thursday, 30 June 2016.

The Issue: The owner desires to build a large, two-story addition on the south (rear) side of the existing house.

Findings:

- 59 West Washington Street stands on the south side of the street, two lots east of Water Street in an R1-50 Residential District. It is bounded on the east and west by private residences and on the south by an alley that provides access from Water Street to a detached two-car, wood-frame garage in the southwest corner of the property. 59 West Washington Street is within the boundaries of the Chagrin Falls West Side District, listed in the National Register of Historic Places.
- Both OHI form CUY711726 and the Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online, date the two-story, wood-frame house to 1907. The latter lists also the date of the detached wood-frame garage to the south, facing the alley, as 1907. The OHI form

59 West Washington Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

notes that the house was altered ca. 1950 but does not specify the alterations. The house appears to be in fair condition.

- The lots in this part of the block between Water and Walnut Streets are relatively small in size and the houses closely spaced. The 59 West Washington Street lot slopes gently to the south alley.
- The OHI form defines the house's architectural style as Greek Revival, which it clearly is not. Although the porch has classical columns, the house is essentially a late vernacular Queen Anne design.
- The proposed two-story addition continues the architectural style of the existing house and the ridge of the proposed gable roof is kept below the peak of the main hip roof. However, it would exhaust most of the remaining open space between the present house and the detached garage to the south. The proposed addition would not be visible from West Washington Street.
- This 1907 house is outside the 1845-1900 period of historical significance of the current West Side National Register District which was created in 1973. However, it would be eligible for listing in a potential future extension of the present end date from 1900 to 1950. According to the Ohio Historic Preservation Office, the District has not been updated since 1973. It is recommended that the Village consider updating the District's period of historical significance to include important post-1900 historical styles represented within its boundaries and possibly extending the boundaries, where appropriate, up to 1950. The update would be consistent with the 1978 Triangle Park National Register Commercial District which has been updated in recent years.

Conclusions and Recommendations: The house at 59 West Washington Street meets the standards of Historical Significance as defined in Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), Section 1146.05 because: a) it is more than 50 years old; b) the house retains much of its original configuration and vernacular late Queen Anne Style and would meet the standards for a contributing structure within an expanded West Side National Register District; and c) it remains a good example of an architectural style popular in the Village in the late 19th and early 20th centuries.

- The proposed two-story south addition would not cause an adverse effect to the historical significance of the house.
- The proposed two-story south addition to the house would not cause an adverse effect to the historical significance of proximate historically significant structures.
- A concern is the size of the proposed addition which removes much of the present open space between the house and the detached garage.

End of Report

Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus
Historic Preservation Consultant
13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4, Cleveland, OH 44120
tedsande@ameritech.net

MEMORANDUM

Date: 25 July 2016

To: Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls,
Ohio

Subject: 45 South Franklin Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

At the Village's request, as provided in Section 1146.03 (a) (2) paragraphs A and C of Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), I have conducted research on the property at 45 South Franklin Street to determine its historical significance and reviewed the proposed plans for changes to it with respect to the potential impact that these changes would have upon the historical significance of this property and the immediate neighborhood in which it stands.

Sources Consulted: a) Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online; b) Ohio Historic Inventory (OHI) listings; c) Gray & Pape Photographic Survey; and d) architectural drawing A-1 prepared by Clemens Pantuso, Architects, and provided by the Village Building and Zoning Department. A site visit was made on Friday, 22 July 2016.

The Issue: The owner desires to add an open front porch and sandstone steps to the west (main) wall of the existing house.

Findings:

- 45 South Franklin Street is located on the east side of the street, opposite the Center Street intersection, in an R1-50 Residential District.
- According to the Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online, the existing house was built in 1903 and the attached garage in 1969. OHI form CUY696426, prepared by Gray & Pape in 2005, dates the house to ca. 1903 and states that the present east garage was added ca. 1980, (rather than 1969); the south addition was made ca. 1930; and, apparently, the original small front porch was enclosed at that time. The house is painted orange and yellow and appears to be in good condition.

45 South Franklin Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

Conclusions and Recommendations: The house at 45 South Franklin Street meets the standards of Historical Significance as defined in Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), Section 1146.05 because: a) it is more than 50 years old; b) despite changes, it remains a good example of a late vernacular Queen Anne Style house, popular in the Village in the late 19th and early 20th centuries; and c) although it has been changed over time, it retains sufficient original configuration to qualify as a contributing structure in a potential future National Register of Historic Places historic district.

- The proposed open west, main entrance, porch and sandstone steps are consistent with the Queen Anne architectural style of the basic house and would not cause an adverse effect to the historical significance of the house.
- The proposed open west, main entrance, porch and sandstone steps would not cause an adverse effect to proximate historically-significant properties.

End of Report