VILLAGE OF CHAGRIN FALLS ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD MINUTES June 7, 2016

Members present: Barclay, Clemens, K. King, S. King

Also present: Edwards

Meeting called to order at: 8:35AM

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motioned by Steve King seconded by Karla King to approve minutes held May 17, 2016. Minutes approved. Mr. Barclay abstained.

Schron 117 Elm Court Addition - preliminary

Mr. Geitz presented revised drawings from May 17, 2016 ARB meeting. A slight modification was made to west elevation to differentiate linear space, but Mr. Clemens was expecting more of a step back in the long wall. Mr. Geitz felt a four inch reduction in the bathroom was possible. Mr. Clemens proposed extending the bedroom by a foot instead of reducing the bathroom. A small window was suggested for bathroom, which would line up with window on first floor.

Steve King made a motion to approve preliminary drawing with addition of 12 inches to bedroom and small window to bathroom, Karla King seconded. Drawings given preliminary approval.

CPD Holdings LLC. 262 South Franklin Street Addition - preliminary Mr. Barclay read HSR as prepared by Mr. Sandi. Karla King made a motion to accept HSR, Steve King seconded. Report accepted.

John Rakauskas presented drawings as well as photos for a porch addition and an addition to rear of house. Requires zoning variance front and side yard encroachment. Mr. Clemens agreed with Mr. Sandi that the addition is massive in comparison to the existing dwelling. A break is needed, whether you step walls back or break the height in some way. Also, windows were suggested for first floor. The extension of the porch was acceptable.

Steve King made a motion to revise and re-submit, Karla seconded. Motion passed.

Broz 410 Bell Street Rear Porch Addition - final

Mr. Barclay read a revised HSR as prepared by Mr. Sandi. Karla King made a motion to accept revised report, Steve King seconded. Revised report accepted.

Marc Graham presented drawings and photos for porch addition in rear of the dwelling. Mr. Clemens felt the porch was a nice addition...no suggestions made.

Steve King made a motion to approve drawings, Karla King seconded. Drawings approved.

Merrill Lynch 45 East Washington Street Signage

Bill Kelleher presented photos for a re-imaged ground sign. The size and and logo design will remain the same, only the background color will change from red to charcoal.

Steve King made motion to approve sign as presented, Karla King seconded. Sign approved.

Berkshire Hathaway Realtors 25 South Franklin Street Signage

Greg Kitzmiller presented drawings for a proposed sign above front door. No suggestions made.

Karla King made a motion to approve sign as presented, Steve King seconded. Sign approved.

Cascade Boutique 10 West Washington Street Signage

A drawing was presented to detail new graphics to be implemented on existing post sign.

Steve King made a motion to approve sign as presented, Karla King seconded. Sign approved.

Patty and Jim Weingart 51 West Cottage Street Walk In Information

The stability of their home has been compromised due to the condominium construction below. They are seeking advice on correcting the situation – whether to make repairs or to demolish and build new. It was stated that the goal of this Board is always to preserve, particularly in a house of this age, but there are instances where the stability of the home has been compromised to such a degree that there may not be another option. It was recommended that the homeowners consult a civil engineer to have an independent survey completed. This survey, along with the survey completed by the condominium developer, should be reviewed by a geotechnical engineer to formulate the best decision.

Peter Greiner 252 Hickery Hill Walk In

Mr. Greiner is not happy with the placement of his neighbor's recently built home/driveway. He did not receive notification from the Village for the impending construction. Mr. Greiner presented photos of said property as seen from Mr. Greiner's front yard. The photos show there is not much buffer between the properties and the view includes the garage and trash receptacles. While it is an unfortunate situation, the neighbor is within all legal guidelines. Views cannot be owned or controlled. Realizing there is nothing to be done, Mr. Greiner said he just wanted it on record.

Meeting Adjourned at 10:05AM.

Robert Barclay, Chairman

Date

Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus Historic Preservation Consultant

13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4, Cleveland, OH 44120 tedsande@ameritech.net

MEMORANDUM

Date: 13 June 2016

To: Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls,

Ohio

Subject: 542 North Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

At the Village's request, as provided in Section 1146.03 (a) (2) paragraphs A and C of Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), I have conducted research on the property at 542 North Street to determine its historical significance and reviewed the proposed plans for changes to it with respect to the potential impact that these changes would have upon the historical significance of this property and the immediate neighborhood in which it stands.

Sources Consulted: a) Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online; b) Ohio Historic Inventory (OHI) listings; c) Gray & Pape Photographic Survey; and d) architectural drawings A-1 and A-2 prepared by Eli Mahler Associates, Architects & Planners, provided by the Village Building and Zoning Department. A site visit, and meeting with the owner, was made on Thursday, 9 June 2016.

<u>The Issue</u>: The owner desires to demolish the existing detached two-car garage and to replace it with a new, larger, detached two-car garage in approximately the same location.

Findings:

- 542 North Street is located on the south side of the street, the third lot west of Longwood Drive in an R-1-100 Residential District. The front portion of the house and garage stand partially on a plateau that then slopes sharply down to the south.
- Both the house and the detached garage were built in 1920, according to the Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online. OHI Form CUY748826 prepared by Gray & Pape in 2005 dates the house to ca. 1925 and does not mention the detached garage.

- The existing detached one-and-a-half story, two car garage is capped by a gable roof facing North Street. The exterior walls are masonry, parged with a cementitious coating.
 It is a stylistically neutral, vernacular, utilitarian structure, compatible with the property's Craftsman Style house, with its rustic-stone front porch pillars and chimney, broad shed roof front porch and dormers. The existing detached garage appears to be in fair to good condition with evidence of masonry-wall surface cracks in several locations.
- The proposed detached one-story, two-car garage continues the precedent of stylistic neutrality of the existing detached garage and would be compatible with the existing Craftsman Style house on the property.

Conclusions and Recommendations: The existing garage at 542 North Street does not meet the standards of Historical Significance as defined in Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), Section 1146.05 because: a) although it is more than 50 years old it is essentially a utilitarian structure that does not have any distinctive architectural or engineering features; b) it is not associated with persons or events significant in Village history; and c) it would not be considered a contributing structure within a potential, future National Register historic district.

- The demolition of the existing detached garage at 542 North Street would not cause an adverse effect to the house on this site nor to proximate historically-significant structures.
- The proposed new detached one-story garage would not cause an adverse effect to the house on this site nor to proximate historically-significant structures.

End of Report

542 North Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus

13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4 Cleveland, Ohio 44120

Tel/Fax: 216-577-6325 email: tedsande@ameritech.net

MEMORANDUM

Date: 1 June 2016

To: Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls,

Ohio

Subject: Addendum No. 2: 410 Bell Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

<u>The Issue</u>: The owner desires to add a covered porch to the south wall of the house with door and window modifications to the first floor to provide sliding door access from the west wing and south wall.

Reference: a) Historical Significance Report dated 17 September 2010 and Addendum No. 1 dated 31 March 2015, both prepared by Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus; and b) General Notes and Site Plan, and a sheet of architectural drawings and details showing the proposed new south covered porch and changes to the existing house prepared by Craig M. Dixon & Associates, Architect, provided by the Village Building and Zoning Department. A site visit was made on Wednesday, 25 May 2016.

Findings:

- The 2010 Historical Significance Report determined that the house met the Village standards for historical significance as defined in Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), Section 1146.05; and that the proposed west addition would not cause an adverse effect to the house or to proximate historically-significant properties.
- The 2015 Addendum No. 1 determined that the then proposed second-story east and west additions would not cause an adverse effect to the house or to proximate historically-significant properties.
- The proposed covered porch is located on the south (rear) side of the house and is not visible from Bell Street.
- The proposed design is consistent with the vernacular Colonial Revival style of the original house and its two prior additions.

Conclusions and Recommendations:

- The proposed south wall covered porch would not cause an adverse effect to the historical significance of the existing house.
- The proposed south wall covered porch would not cause an adverse effect to proximate historically-significant properties.

End of Addendum

Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus Historic Preservation Consultant

13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4, Cleveland, OH 44120 tedsande@ameritech.net

MEMORANDUM

Date:

1 June 2016

To:

Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls,

Ohio

Subject:

262 South Franklin Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

At the Village's request, as provided in Section 1146.03 (a) (2) paragraphs A and C of Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), I have conducted research on the property at 262 South Franklin Street to determine its historical significance and reviewed the proposed plans for changes to it with respect to the potential impact that these changes would have upon the historical significance of this property and the immediate neighborhood in which it stands.

Sources Consulted: a) Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online; b) Ohio Historic Inventory (OHI) listings; c) Gray & Pape Photographic Survey; and d) architectural drawings 1.0, 5.0 through 8.0 showing a site plan and elevations of the proposed changes prepared by Rakauskas Architecture, provided by the Village Building and Zoning Department. Site visits was made on Wednesday, 25 May, and Saturday, 28 May 2016.

<u>The Issue</u>: The owner desires to: 1) extend the front (east) porch to the full east wall width; 2) construct a large two-story, gable-roof addition and open wood deck on the west side of the house; 3) install a new asphalt shingle roof, and 4) to sheath both the existing house and the new addition in a vinyl, simulated wood shingle siding.

Findings:

262 South Franklin Street is located on a deep, narrow lot on the west side of the street
opposite the Pine Street intersection in an R1-100 Residential District. This portion of
South Franklin Street, from Carriage Stone Drive south to the Bentleyville Village line
defines the east boundary of Chagrin Falls at its southwest corner. The house is
currently vacant and appears to be in fair condition.

- The row of wood-frame houses on the west side of South Franklin Street, from lot 210 to lot 290, is a consistent row of small to medium size houses in vernacular variations of Classical Revival and compatible styles that appear to have been built from ca. 1890 to ca. 1920. There is sufficient surviving historical fabric in the majority of these houses to suggest that this strip from lot 210 to lot 290 may have the potential for listing in the National Register of Historic Places as a future historic district.
- The front-gable house immediately south of 262 South Franklin Street, number 268, has a large two-story addition on its west side similar in size and configuration to the proposed west addition for 262. According to OHI Form 707526 prepared by Gray & Pape in 2005, the west (rear) addition was built ca. 1980 90. It appears that the addition's second story may have been added later, since it is not visible in the ca. 2005 Gray & Pape photographic survey view of the house. The Building and Zoning Department advises me that it does not have any information on this property, which appears to have been modified prior to the enacting of the current Historic Preservation Ordinance.
- The house and detached garage were built in 1920, according to the Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online. OHI Form CUY707726 prepared by Gray & Pape in 2005 agrees with the 1920 date and notes that a one-story addition was built ca. 1940. The form also notes that the structure is possibly a "kit house", but does not provide any evidence to support this supposition. Mail order prefabricated, woodframe houses were popular in this country from the 1870s to about 1930. The Sears Roebuck Co. is probably the best known supplier during those years. Typically, the buyer had the pieces shipped to the site and erected by a local licensed contractor. However, it is just as likely that this house is a vernacular Colonial Revival or Craftsman Bungalow variation by a local builder.
- The front porch steps, railing and curved side roofs appear to be later additions. There is a one-story shed-roof, west side addition, probably dating to the ca. 1940 southwest addition noted above by Gray & Pape. These additions are not compatible with the original house, but are small in size and do not significantly effect the historical configuration of the house. The dominant cross-gable and shed dormers on the east and west roofs remain distinctive features of the house.

262 South Franklin Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

Conclusions and Recommendations: The house at 262 South Franklin Street meets the standards of Historical Significance as defined in Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), Section 1146.05 because: a) it is more than 50 years old; b) whether it is a prefabricated "kit house" or locally built, it is a good example of a vernacular Colonial Revival style popular in the Village during the early 20th century; and c) despite the several additions to the house, it still retains much of its original configuration, sufficient for it to be considered a contributing structure within a potential future National Register historic district.

- The proposed changes to this house would alter its present historical appearance significantly by increasing its size and obscuring its visually-prominent cross gable roof and shed dormer configuration as seen from the east, south, west and north as is evident in architectural drawings 5.0, 6.0, 7.0 and 8.0. Collectively, these changes would cause an adverse effect to the historical significance of the house.
- The proposed changes outlined above would cause an adverse effect to the historical significance of proximate historically-significant structures.

End of Report