VILLAGE OF CHAGRIN FALLS ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD MINUTES July 7, 2015

Members present: Koepf, Fredrickson, Barclay, and Clemens

King absent

Also present: Edwards

Meeting called to order at: 8:31 AM

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motioned by, Mr. Barclay seconded by Mrs. Fredrickson, to approve minutes held June 21, 2015. Motion passed.

1 The h'Art of Chagrin 100 North Main Street Awnings
Debra Fisher presented information for projecting sign and awnings.
Motioned by Fredrickson, seconded by Barclay to approve as presented. Motion passed.

- 2 Valley Art Center 155 Bell Street Post sign
 Ethan from ES signs presented post sign. Motioned by Fredrickson, seconded by Barclay to approve as submitted. Motion passed.
- 3 Newbauer 65 Olive Street Addition Preliminary
 Mr. Barclay reviewed the HSR that was prepared by Mr.Sande. Motioned by Fredrickson,
 seconded by Barclay to accept the report. Motion passed.

Richard Gates architect, and property owner Jeff Newbauer presented plans for addition to the rear of dwelling and new attached garage.

Motioned by Fredrickson, to revise and resubmit with the following comments;

- 1. Match existing elevation details and materials
- 2. Rework gable on the garage to center garage door.

Seconded by Barclay. Motion passed.

4 Insana Homes 80 Carriage Stone Alterations

Mr. Barclay reviewed the HSR that was prepared by Mr. Sande. Motioned by Fredrickson, seconded by Barclay to accept the report.

Pete Insanna, property owner presented plans for siding and window alteration. Motioned by Fredrickson, to approved with the following comments;

- 1. Remove shutters with the exception of the ones on the brick front elevations.
- 2. Vapor wrap material prior to vinyl siding. Motion passed.

5 Wyville 203 Monticello Alterations

Dave Jansen, architect presented window and door alterations to the rear of house. Motioned by Barclay, seconded by Fredrickson to approved. Motion passed.

- 6 Steger 135 Solon Road Addition Final Mark Bonner, architect presented final plans for an addition.

 Motioned by Fredrickson, seconded by Barclay to approve as submitted. Motion Passed.
- 7 Berlin 20 Timber Ridge Alteration
 Marc Graham designer presented plans for replacement garage doors. Motioned by Fredrickson, seconded by Barclay to approve as submitted. Motion passed.

Meeting adjourned at 9:30 AM.

Robert Barclay, Chairman

Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus Historic Preservation Consultant

13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4, Cleveland, OH 44120 tedsande@ameritech.net

MEMORANDUM

Date: 25 June 2015

To: Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls,

Ohio

Subject: 65 Olive Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

At the Village's request, as provided in Section 1146.03 (a) (2) paragraphs A and C of Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), I have conducted research on the property at 65 Olive Street to determine its historical significance and reviewed the proposed plans for changes to it with respect to the potential impact that these changes would have upon the historical significance of this property and the immediate neighborhood in which it stands.

Sources Consulted: a) Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online; b) Ohio Historic Inventory (OHI) listings; c) Gray & Pape Photographic Survey; and d) architectural drawings including a site plan, floor plan, elevations and sections prepared by Richard S. Gates, AIA, Architect, and provided by the Village Building and Zoning Department. A site visit was made on Thursday, 25 June 2015.

<u>The Issue</u>: The owner desires to replace an existing one-story, three-car detached garage with a new one-story addition and canted one-story, two-car attached garage.

Findings:

- 65 Olive Street is located on the south side of the street, eight lots east of Robens Court, in an R1-50 Residential District. It is outside the southern boundary of the Chagrin Falls West Side District listed in the National Register of Historic Places.
- The lot is an "L" shape, with the long leg on the north/south axis and a short leg projecting to the east at the south end of the lot. The terrain of the south leg pitches sharply down near its southern boundary.
- According to the Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online, the existing 2 and 1/2 story, wood-frame house was built in 1927 and a detached three-car garage was

built in 1987. OHI form CUY749826, prepared by Gray & Pape in 2005, dates the house to ca. 1926 and identifies it as "Greek Revival", which clearly it is not. Stylistically, the house is a vernacular, Prairie Style, as defined by the McAlesters in their A Field Guide to American Houses (pages 438-451). The form provides a historic name: the Warner & Lottie Stadler House. The form also notes aluminum or vinyl siding, a rear (south) addition ca. 1980-90 and the garage. Not noted is a small garden house south of the garage which may have been added after 2005.

- The house appears to be in fair to good condition and has changed since the 2005 OHI form was prepared and the Photographic Survey of that year was conducted. The exterior aluminum or vinyl siding has been removed and it appears that the original shingle second floor and horizontal board first floor sidings have been restored and painted or stained to a medium brown color. The synthetic siding remains on the detached garage. The grounds have also been considerably enriched with floral gardens.
- The proposed new addition and canted garage would be appended to the existing 1987 one-story south addition. The architect's drawing of the proposed floor plan and garage section also contains an isometric drawing that does not agree with either the site plan or the floor plan. The plans show the garage canted and the isometric shows a right-angle configuration. The sections seem confusing as well. The proposed canted plan raises questions about circulation and access to the southerly portion of the property.

Conclusions and Recommendations: The house at 65 Olive Street meets the standards of Historical Significance as defined in Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), Section 1146.05 because: a) it is more than 50 years old; b) it retains much of its original configuration; c) it represents a vernacular style that was popular in the Village during the first third of the 20th Century; and d) it would be eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places as a contributing structure within a potential future National Register historic district.

- The proposed south addition and new garage would not cause an adverse effect to the historical significance of the house.
- The proposed south addition and new garage would not cause an adverse effect to the historical significance of proximate historically-significant properties.

End of Report

65 Olive Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus Historic Preservation Consultant

13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4, Cleveland, OH 44120 tedsande@ameritech.net

MEMORANDUM

Date:

25 June 2015

To:

Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls,

Ohio

Subject:

80 Carriage Stone Drive, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

At the Village's request, as provided in Section 1146.03 (a) (2) paragraphs A and C of Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), I have conducted research on the property at 80 Carriage Stone Drive to determine its historical significance and reviewed the proposed plans for changes to it with respect to the potential impact that these changes would have upon the historical significance of this property and the immediate neighborhood in which it stands.

Sources Consulted: a) Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online; b) Ohio Historic Inventory (OHI) listings; c) Gray & Pape Photographic Survey; and d) architectural drawings, including a site plan and proposed front elevation, prepared by Pete Insana and provided by the Village Building and Zoning Department. A site visit was made on Thursday, 25 June 2015.

The Issue: The owner desires to make exterior changes to the siding on all four walls and to modify the fenestration on the front (south) wall.

Findings:

- 80 Carriage Stone Drive is located on the north side of the street, four lots east of Monticello Drive, in an R1-100 Residential District.
- According to the Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online, the house and
 its attached two-car garage were built in 1965. There is no OHI form nor Photographic
 Survey photo for this property. The house, which is clad in brick, vertical board and
 clapboard siding, appears to be in fair condition and undergoing extensive renovation.
 A large dumpster filled with refuse stands near the garage.

<u>Conclusions and Recommendations:</u> The house at 80 Carriage Stone Drive does not meet the standards of Historical Significance as defined in Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), Section 1146.05, although it is 50 years old, because it is not listed in the National Register of Historic Places and it does not appear that it would be eligible for listing in the National Register, either individually or as a contributing structure within a potential future National Register historic district.

- The proposed changes to the house at 80 Carriage Stone Drive would not have an adverse effect on its historical significance.
- The proposed changes to the house at 80 Carriage Stone Drive would not have an adverse effect on proximate historically-significant structures.

End of Report