VILLAGE OF CHAGRIN FALLS ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD MINUTES May 6, 2014

Members present:

Koepf, Fredrickson, King, and Clemens

Barclay absent.

Also present: Edwards

Meeting called to order at: 8:30 AM

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motioned by Mr. King, seconded by Mrs. Fredrickson to approve minutes held April 15,2014. Motion passed.

Maciver 144 Elm Ct. Porch addition

Marc Graham presented plans for new screen porch addition rear of house, front porch addition, new basement windows, reside & trim.

Moved by Mrs. Fredrickson, to approve with the condition that they replace the window on the garage with a double hung window. Seconded by Mr. King.

Roll call: Fredrickson; Yes, King; Yes. Motion passed.

Chagrin Falls Safeway Tire 129 Solon Rd Exterior alterations,

Mrs. Fredrickson reviewed Mr. Sande report Moved by Mrs. Fredrickson to accept his report seconded by Mr. King Roll call: Fredrickson: Yes, King: Yes. Motion passed.

Marcus Yagour, store owner presented plans for siding and shake shingle siding, Cultured stone façade. Moved by Mrs. Fredrickson to approve with the following comments:

- 1) Add muttons to front office window
- 2) Lower cultured stone on the right office building side to bottom of front window
- 3) Shake in gable on both sides and use 7"- 8"vinyl clapperboard elsewhere Seconded by Mr. King.

Roll call: Fredrickson: Yes, King: Yes. Motion passed.

Chagrin Falls Safeway Tire

129 Solon Rd

signage

Marcus Yagour, presented signage for new sign using existing projecting sign on front of building. Moved by Mr. King, seconded by Mrs. Fredrickson.

Roll call: Fredrickson: Yes, King: Yes. Motion passed.

Apricot Lane

31 North Franklin St.

signage

No one present to represent storeowner on wall sign. Moved Mr. King, to approve. Seconded by Mrs. Fredrickson.

Roll call: Fredrickson: Yes, King: Yes. Motion passed.

Manchen 83 Ridgewood New dwelling

Dave Leber, architect, presented final plans for new dwelling. Moved by Mrs. Fredrickson, to approve with the following comments:

- 1) Change shutters on right front elevation by eliminating the two inside shutters.
- 2) Include a rake detail showing 1x3 shingle mold over rake board on front elevation. Seconded by Mr. King.

Roll call: Fredrickson: Yes, King: Yes. Motion passed. preliminary review March 4, 2014

Henry 264 Bell St alterations

Lisa Fredrickson reviewed Mr. Sande report, Mr. Sande felt that if the house would be sided as submitted that would cause an adverse effect to surrounding properties. Moved by Mrs. Fredrickson, seconded by Mr. King. Roll call: Fredrickson: Yes, King: Yes. Motion passed. Steve Circretto architect, presented window alteration, Mr. Ciciretto mentioned that the home owner has decided not reside as originally presented and keep the existing vinyl siding. After further discussion the submission was tabled some of the recommendations were to consider reconfigure the front porch posts, using a smaller casement with a horizontal mutton bar to match existing. Mr. Cirretto will return in couple of weeks. Not action taken.

River Walk Dev. 44

44 West Orange St.

Preliminary #2

Bob Vitt, property owner, presented a second field change to modify the double unit to a single unit. Option one was what was approved back on March 4, 2014, but those variances have expired.

Two options were presented. Option #2 is at 35' in height, and would not require any variances the driveway would have no place to turn around since it would exceed the 25% coverage for driveways and would have to back out onto West Orange Street.

Option #3, is a building height of 46' which was previous with the phase one portion and would require a variance for parking area in the front yard along with the building height. The board approved of both options a preliminary, but would preferred option #3. Motioned by Mrs. Fredrickson, seconded by Mr. King to give preliminary approval. Roll Call: Fredrickson: Yes, King: Yes. Motion passed.

Falls Walk 135 Pear Tree circle SL 21 Proposed FC

John Brown present a proposed field change adding gables over the porch and a window above the porch. Removed roof returns around garage roof plate. The board recommended increasing the brackets and overhangs and add a gable. Mr. Brown will submit for the next meeting for field change.

Meeting adjourned at 10:00 am.

retary

Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus Historic Preservation Consultant

13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4, Cleveland, OH 44120 tedsande@ameritech.net

MEMORANDUM

Date:

30 April 2014

To:

Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls,

Ohio

Subject:

129 Maple Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

At the Village's request, as provided in Section 1146.03 (a) (2) paragraphs A and C of Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), I have conducted research on the property at 129 Maple Street to determine its historical significance and reviewed the proposed plans for changes to it with respect to the potential impact that these changes would have upon the historical significance of this property and the immediate neighborhood in which it stands.

Sources Consulted: a) Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online; b) Ohio Historic Inventory (OHI) listings; c) Gray & Pape Photographic Survey; and d) architectural drawings 01 and 02 and Stockton Windows Model 5614 hinged garage door elevation submitted by the owner and provided by the Village Building and Zoning Department. A site visit was made on Tuesday, 29 April 2014.

<u>The Issue</u>: The owner desires to reside the exterior of the building with shake shingles above a cultured stone base; restore the original garage door openings and replace the present overhead doors with pairs of tall hinged doors.

Findings:

- 129 Maple Street stands at the southeast corner of the intersection of Maple Street and Solon Road in an R1-50 Residential District. It is not within the Chagrin Falls West Side National Register Historic District.
- The building is an automobile service station that was built ca. 1930, according to OHI form CUY759826 prepared by Gray & Pape in 2005. The station has been altered, probably several times, during the intervening 84 years.

129 Maple Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

• The exterior is currently exposed concrete block and wood clapboards, painted a uniform maroon color.

Conclusions and Recommendations: The automobile service station at 129 Maple Street does not meet the standards of Historical Significance as defined in Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), Section 1146.05 because: a) even though it is more than 50 years old, it does not appear to have retained its original character-defining elements; b) it does not possess any distinctive architectural or historical features, nor is associated with persons or events significant in Village history; and c) it would not be considered a contributing structure within a potential future expansion of the adjacent Chagrin Falls West Side National Register Historic District.

- The proposed changes to the exterior of the automobile service station would not have an adverse effect upon its historical significance.
- The proposed changes to the exterior of the automobile service station would not have an adverse effect upon proximate historically-significant structures.

End of Report

Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus Historic Preservation Consultant

13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4, Cleveland, OH 44120 tedsande@ameritech.net

MEMORANDUM

Date:

1 May 2014

To:

Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls,

Ohio

Subject:

264 Bell Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

At the Village's request, as provided in Section 1146.03 (a) (2) paragraphs A and C of Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), I have conducted research on the property at 264 Bell Street to determine its historical significance and reviewed the recent changes and proposed plans for changes to it with respect to the potential impact that these changes would have upon the historical significance of this property and the immediate neighborhood in which it stands.

Sources Consulted: a) Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online; b) Ohio Historic Inventory (OHI) listings; c) Chagrin Falls Historical Society Archives; d) Chagrin Falls: An Ohio Village History; e) Gray & Pape Photographic Survey; and f) architectural drawing A-1, Basement Plan with photos of the north and south exterior walls, prepared by Stephen Ciciretto, AIA, Architect, and provided by the Village Building and Zoning Department. A site visit was made on Tuesday, 29 April 2014.

<u>The Issue</u>: The owner desires to remove the existing vinyl siding and to replace it with a new smooth-surface insulated stucco siding. The owner has already replaced two attic level windows on the north and south walls and removed the west chimney.

Findings:

- 264 Bell Street is on the south side of the street, four lots east of South Cleveland Street in an R1-60 Residential District.
- According to the Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online, the two-story, wood-frame house was built in 1920. OHI form CUY723026 dates the house to ca.
 1907 and classifies it as Greek Revival. That classification is not correct. Late Vernacular Queen Anne is more accurate, following Virginia & Lee McAlester's A Field Guide to American Houses. (See pages 262-285.)

- The OHI form identifies this as the C. A. Payne House. This name does not appear in the Chagrin Falls village history nor in the Historical Society's archives.
- The OHI form notes that a bay window was added ca. 1920 and a chimney (now removed) added ca. 1970.
- A detached 1.5 story, two-car garage, undated, with an apartment over the garage stands to the southeast of the house.
- Concern: No information has been provided on the technical specifications of the proposed smooth stucco siding. If it is smooth surfaced, without a simulated clapboard appearance, it would not be compatible with the historical Queen Anne style of the house, a character defining feature of which was its original wood clapboard or shingle horizontal, parallel-line, appearance. This feature is also present on proximate structures in this neighborhood that either retain wood clapboard siding or have vinyl/aluminum replacement siding with this historical appearance.

Conclusions and Recommendations: The house at 264 Bell Street meets the standards of Historical Significance as defined in Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), Section 1146.05 because: a) it is more than 50 years old; b) it is a good example of a late vernacular Queen Anne style house; and c) it would be considered a contributing structure within a potential future National Register historic district.

- A proposed smooth-surface siding would cause an adverse effect to the historical significance of this house.
- A proposed smooth-surface siding would cause an adverse effect to proximate historically-significant structures.
- The new upper windows on the north and south walls and the removal of the west chimney do not cause an adverse effect to this house; nor do these changes cause an adverse effect to proximate historically-significant structures.

End of Report

264 Bell Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio