

**VILLAGE OF CHAGRIN FALLS
ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW**

SEPTEMBER 5, 2023

Meeting Called to Order 8:30 A.M.

Members Present: Bill Childs, George Clemens, Steve King, Phil Koepf, Wendy Naylor

Also Present: Rob Jamieson

Absent: Dominic Cribari, Joan Andersen

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion by Naylor, seconded by Childs to approve the minutes of the August 15, 2023, meeting. Roll Call: Naylor-yea, Childs-yea, King-abstain. Motion passed.

1. Reid 141 West Summit Street Exterior Alteration-Window Changes

Steve King read the Historical Significance Report (HSR) and stated that the house at 141 West Summit does not meet the standards of a Historically Significant Property as defined in Codified Ordinance Section 1146.05 (a)(1); and, the proposed exterior change has no adverse effect on the design and historical significance of the house. Motion by King, seconded by Naylor to accept the HSR. Roll Call: Naylor-yea, King-yea, Childs-yea. Motion passed.

Ryan Hume from Window Nation presented these plans for vinyl replacement windows. He stated that the replacement window muntin pattern will match the existing historic windows as advised in the HSR.

Summation- Motion by Naylor, seconded by King to accept plans as presented with muntin pattern to match existing historic windows. King noted that vinyl windows have a limited life span Roll Call: King-yea, Childs-yea, Naylor-yea. Motion passed.

2. Delaney 189 Senlac Hills Drive Exterior Alteration – Prelim

Rob Jamieson stated a variance is required because the proposed addition is located in an existing nonconforming side yard setback but it is not adding to the footprint. Architect Beckey Pantuso presented plans with a gambrel roof second-floor addition over the existing garage. Childs noted that from a massing standpoint, the existing house is horizontal and the addition is vertical making it appear as one continuous large volume. He suggested making the entry wider and more pronounced with a pediment and columns and a wider entry door to balance the massing of the composition. Clemens stated that the addition is set back to lessen the impact of the volume. Naylor noted that the neighborhood streetscape pattern is houses with one-story garage additions. Koepf stated that the gambrel roof feature needs to be more defined. The design needs to lighten up the second floor perhaps with the removal of dormers. Childs suggested another option of a reverse gable off the back of the

existing garage to allow enjoyment of the back yard and then blend with the existing streetscape. Pantuso requested specific guidance from the board. Koepf stated that massing of the addition should be pushed down and dormers removed to define the gambrel roof. Board reiterated the comments presented. The architect declined request to table submission with comments and asked for a vote on the presented plans.

Summation- Motion by Naylor seconded by King to approve plans as presented. Roll Call: King-nay, Childs-nay, Naylor-nay. Motion failed.

Summation- Motion amended by Naylor seconded by King to deny plans as presented with stated reasons: The massing of the addition composition is too big, front entry is out of scale with the door with need to take care of blank space beside the door. Massing above garage needs to be reduced to create a hierarchy between the main house element and addition which will also allow the house to better blend with the existing neighborhood streetscape. Push massing down and reduce dormers to define the gambrel roof. Another option is a reverse gable first-floor master suite extending from behind the existing garage to blend with the existing streetscape. Roll Call: King-yea, Childs-yea, Naylor-yea. Motion failed.

3. Payne/Battles

51 Water Street

Exterior Alteration-Preliminary

Steve King read the Historical Significance Report (HSR) and stated that the house at 51 Water does meet the standards of a Historically Significant Property as defined in Codified Ordinance Section 1146.05 (a)(1) and the proposed exterior change has no adverse effect on the design and historical significance of the house. Motion by King, seconded by Naylor to accept the HSR. Roll Call: Naylor-yea, King-yea, Childs-yea. Motion passed.

Phil Koepf (Architect) and Amy Battles (Homeowner) presented these plans. A front yard variance is required for the addition of the 6' front porch. The architect presented historic images and evidence of a historic front porch at the same location and-like appearance. The proposed porch location, appearance, and materials are to be compatible with the historic porch. The architect stated that the property slopes towards the street which also benefits from a smaller porch.

Summation-motion by Naylor, seconded by King for preliminary approval of plans as presented, recommending a variance to reinstate the historic porch based on historical evidence using compatible materials. Roll Call: Childs-yea, King-yea, Naylor-yea. Motion passed.

4. Shivers

269 North Street

Exterior Alteration-Window Changes

Steve King read the Historical Significance Report (HSR) and stated that the house at 269 North Street does meet the standards of a Historically Significant Property as defined in Codified Ordinance Section 1146.05 (a)(1). The proposed changes have an adverse effect on the design and historical significance of the house with proposed solution of matching the munitn pattern of Fibrex replacement windows to existing historic windows. Motion by King, seconded by Naylor to accept the HSR. Roll Call: Naylor-yea, King-yea, Childs-yea. Motion passed.

