VILLAGE OF CHAGRIN FALLS ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD MINUTES December 19, 2017

Members present: Barclay, Clemens, King, Koepf, Naylor.

Also Present: Edwards, Jamieson, Himes, Law Director Markowitz

Meeting called to order at: 8:30 AM

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion by Naylor, second by King to approve December 5 meeting minutes. Motion passed.

The following minutes are a summation of comments and discussions relative to each agenda item, rather than a full recitation, due to the length of the meeting.

Members of the public wishing to speak were sworn in by Law Director Markowitz.

1. Strauss 23 Water Street Demolition, New Dwelling-Preliminary – Tabled

The November 7 meeting was continued with new information presented by appraisers Andrew Leirer and Charles Dudas regarding comparable house prices within the West Side Historic District. Appraisers agreed that \$255/sq. ft. was the average price for historic houses over 2,000 sq. ft. sold within the defined area over the past 2 years. A variety of factors were considered, which are further described in the Leirer report. The Board conveyed that the factor of functional obsolescence discussed by appraiser Dudas, including low ceilings and small rooms, often includes character defining features of historic homes which are an asset rather than a detriment to the house. Attorney Jorden Berns presented interior and exterior photos of the house at the time of purchase with oral descriptions presented by owner Mrs. Strauss. Mrs. Strauss stated that house is not habitable in its current condition. Board members conducted site visits to the house in Spring 2017. The Board reiterated the compromise position of allowing demolition of the east rear addition to the house on the condition that the historic west front portion of the house is retained and rehabilitated.

Clemens and Koepf stated that the Sinopoli cost of construction estimate presents a hypothetical renovation and makes assumptions about work that may not be required. Koepf stated that if items that are not necessary for rehabilitation are removed from Sinopoli estimate, the renovation cost is about \$204/sq. ft. Clemens stated that per item estimates were high. Sinopoli was not present at the meeting.

The Board moved to Executive Session with motion by Naylor, second by King. Motion passed.

The Board returned to the public meeting. Koepf presented the Cuyahoga County Auditor's map showing a discrepancy in dimensions of the historic portion of the house, which has been presented as composed of 927 sq. ft. The Board requested clarification for purposes of determining the sq. ft. cost of renovation, which is central to the economic feasibility of rehabilitating the house.

Motion by Naylor requesting the owner submit accurate drawings showing gross floor space of the historic portion of the house including first and second floors. If it is determined that it is not composed of 927 sq. ft., and there is a significant variation, estimated construction cost estimates should be resubmitted. Second by King. Motion passed.

Motion by Naylor to table preliminary review of proposed plans for new dwelling until historic house dimensions are submitted, allowing ARB to determine what portions of the house will be or not be demolished under the Code. Second by King. Motion passed.

The next ARB meeting was scheduled for January 9, 8:30 AM.

2. Holesski/Weber

20 Bellview Street

Addition-Preliminary Approval

The Historical Significance Report (HSR) as prepared by Mr. Sande states that the existing house meets the standards for historical significance as defined by Village Code. Mr. Sande states that the proposed changes to the house do not cause an adverse effect to the historic significance of the property and to proximately located historically significant buildings.

Motion that Historic Significance Report was reviewed and accepted by Naylor, second by Barclay. Motion passed.

Architect Dave Jenson and Owners presented plans which were met with positive comment from the Board. Clemens requested the first floor addition over powder room be switched from a hip to shed roof to support the dormer. Koepf suggested removal of shutters from the house.

Motion by Naylor for Preliminary Approval of plans as presented with first floor addition over powder room switched from a hip to shed roof, second by King. Motion passed.

3. LaTour

145 Cleveland Street

Addition - Final Approval

Designer Marc Graham and Owner Krista Latour presented proposed windows and Phase I and II plans for rehabilitation which received positive comment from the Board. Clemens requested 2" thick window muntin bars on first floor, to simulate double hung windows. Koepf pointed out proposed grade changes and potential drainage issues.

Motion for Final Approval of plans as presented with 2" thick window muntin bars on first floor, to simulate double hung by Naylor, second by King. Motion passed.

4. Dolan/Hill

57 Water Street

Fence-Final Approval

Architect David Thorn presented plans for fence which were met with positive comment. Koepf and Clemens requested that fence end away from garage to float the fence as a standing element, with no structure touching structure.

Motion by King for Final Approval of plans as presented with fence ending at a point separate from existing structures, second by Naylor. Motion passed.

Signage- Final Approval

5. Bell & Flower

86 North Main Street

Sign design was met with positive comment from the Board.

Motion for approval of plan as presented by Naylor, second by King. Motion passed.

WALK-IN

Johnson

89 East Cottage Street

Architect Michael Caito and Owner presented proposed plans for house addition. The Board suggested a gable dormer, and narrower east side elevation when viewed from façade.

Adjourned at 11:23 AM