

**VILLAGE OF CHAGRIN FALLS
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD MINUTES
August 2, 2016**

Members present: Barclay, Clemens, Koepf, Naylor. Absent: King.

Also present: Edwards

Meeting called to order at: 8:30 AM

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion by Naylor second by Barclay, to approve July 19 meeting minutes. Motion passed.

1. Hamori 194 Low Street New dwelling- Revise & Resubmit

Mr. Barclay called a public meeting. Neighbor Jim Black stated he had no objections. Applicant-owner Steve Hamori and Architect Nat Barrett presented drawings and photographs. The Board had the following comments: the massing and standing seam roof work well; explore alternatives to vinyl siding using more historically compatible materials such as wood shiplap siding; board and batten spacing appears off; combination of vertical and horizontal siding does not work - needs to be one or the other; relationship of windows and scale of trim needs study with introduction of more windows; over all color scheme too dark; plan needs to be more cohesive and compatible with surrounding properties.

Motion to re-study and resubmit drawings by Barclay, second by Naylor. Motion passed.

2. CF Township Hall 83 North Main Street Window Alteration/Door- Approved

Mr. Barclay read the Historical Significance Report (HSR) dated 7/25/16 as prepared by Mr. Sande which states that the Chagrin Falls Township Hall meets the standards for historical significance as defined by Village Code; states that the proposed change of the northeast window to a door and adding an exterior landing and steps on the north wall of the existing building would not cause an adverse effect.

Architect Henry Piper presented drawings and photographs of the "Larry Shibley door" installed at main entry to Apricot Lane Boutique located at 31 North Franklin. Similar door to be manufactured and installed at Township Hall north elevation maintaining existing masonry opening as closely as possible to accommodate new door.

Motion to accept Historic Significance Report by Barclay, second by Naylor. Motion passed.

Motion to approve proposed door and installation as submitted moved by Barclay, second by Naylor. Motion passed.

3. Tanchon 114 South Franklin Street Addition to Rear & Front Porch – Preliminary-Approval

Mr. Barclay read the Historical Significance Report Addendum No. 1 (HSR) dated 7/27/16 as prepared by Mr. Sande which states that 114 South Franklin Street meets the standards for historical significance as defined by Village Code; and states that the proposed changes would not cause an adverse effect subject to clarification of discrepancy between existing and proposed addition shown on drawing A-1.

Architect George Clemmons and owner Jeff Tanchon presented drawings and photographs. Mr. Koepf requested that panels on rear addition be replaced with siding; and, that rear transoms be re-studied or removed and replaced with elongated 1/1 windows.

Motion to accept Historic Significance Report by Naylor, second by Barclay. Motion passed.
Motion for Preliminary approval with comments from Mr. Koepf by Naylor, second by Barclay. Motion passed.

4. Mergenhagen 109 East Washington Street Addition – Preliminary-Approved
Mr. Barclay read the Historical Significance Report dated 7/26/16 as prepared by Mr. Sande which states that 109 East Washington Street meets the standards for historical significance as defined by Village Code; and states that the proposed changes would not cause an adverse effect.

Architect George Clemmons presented drawings and photographs. Mrs. Naylor suggested removal of the shutters as more in keeping with the Queen Anne style of the home. Mr. Koepf advised to scale new trim to existing trim.

Motion to accept Historic Significance Report by Naylor, second by Barclay. Motion passed.
Motion for Preliminary Approval by Barclay, second by Naylor. Motion passed.

5. Quintin 45 South Franklin Street Porch Addition – Preliminary- Revise & Resubmit
Mr. Barclay read the Historical Significance Report (HSR) dated 7/25/16 as prepared by Mr. Sande which states that 45 South Franklin Street meets the standards for historical significance as defined by Village Code.

Architect Amanda Kristoff presented drawings and photographs of proposed front porch addition. Ms. Naylor showed the 1926 Sanborn Map with configuration of a squared off front porch on the house, which is historically compatible instead of the proposed porch with octagonal projection. Mr. Koepf stated it would be hard to scale the octagonal component to the house.

Motion by Naylor that Historic Significance Report was reviewed, second by Barclay. Motion passed.
Motion to re-study and re-submit drawings by Barclay, second by Naylor. Motion passed.

6. Miller 291 North Main Street New Dwelling – Final Approval
Architects Corey Ringle and Al Krause present. Architect Ringle presented drawings for single family dwelling on vacant lot. Plans were met with positive comment with suggestion of railing at open door to block & tackle. Bark siding was reduced to one-half size of proposed sample presented for preliminary approval.

Motion for Final Approval by Barclay, second by Naylor. Motion passed.

7. CPD Realty 262 South Franklin Addition – Preliminary- Revise & Resubmit
Applicant David Dickson presented drawings and RSK review letter, stamped not approved. Mr. Clemmons pointed out positive improvements to windows on south elevation, and stoop added to side entry at north elevation. Mr. Koepf commented that massing was correct, roof overhangs need to match with eave details that both need to be reflected in drawings; requested large scale section drawings with exterior details. Board requested revision and resubmittal of plans to address RSK letter and Board comments.

Motion to re-study and re-submit drawings by Barclay, second by Naylor. Motion passed.

Adjourned at 10:06 am


Robert Barclay, Chairman Date

Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus
Historic Preservation Consultant
13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4, Cleveland, OH 44120
tedsande@ameritech.net

MEMORANDUM

Date: 25 July 2016

To: Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls,
Ohio

Subject: 83 North Main Street, The Chagrin Falls Township Hall, Chagrin Falls,
Ohio

At the Village's request, as provided in Section 1146.03 (a) (2) paragraphs A and C of Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), I have conducted research on the property at 83 North Main Street to determine its historical significance and reviewed the proposed plans for changes to it with respect to the potential impact that these changes would have upon the historical significance of this property and the immediate neighborhood in which it stands.

Sources Consulted: a) Ohio Historic Inventory (OHI) listings; b) Chagrin Falls Triangle Park Commercial District National Register of Historic Places Nomination Form, 1978; c) *Chagrin Falls: An Ohio Village History*; d) Chagrin Falls Township, article on history of the Township and Township Hall, website; e) "Chagrin Falls Township Hall to become renovated wedding venue this year (photo gallery)", article by Kaitlyn Ridel, Northeast Ohio Media Group, March 19, 2014; and f) architectural drawings A-1 through A-5 prepared by Henry G. Piper, Architect, and provided by the Village Building and Zoning Department. A site visit was made on Friday, 22 July 2016.

The Issue: The owner desires to change the first-floor northeast window of the Meeting Room to a door and to add an exterior landing and steps on the north wall of the existing building.

Findings:

- 83 North Main Street, The Chagrin Falls Township Hall, is located on the west side of the street, the second lot north of River Street, in a CS Central Shopping District. The east (main) wall is set back from the sidewalk to accommodate stone main entrance steps. It is surrounded on the south, west and north by commercial buildings and separated from them by narrow sidewalks and alleys.

83 North Main Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

- The Chagrin Falls Township Hall is a contributing structure within the Chagrin Falls Triangle Park Commercial District. It has a "T" shape plan with the top of the T housing a Visitors' Center/reference desk on the first floor and the Chamber of Commerce offices on the mezzanine, facing east on North Main Street. The stem of the T is a one-story meeting room, with an ADA door and ramp at its southeast corner and a sealed, deteriorated, door at its southwest corner. The Township Hall is a defining feature of the historic district, with its prominent cupola rising above the adjacent structures.
- The Township Hall is described in the National Register district nomination as "a Greek Revival building first altered in the late Victorian era and then restored after a fire in 1944". A history of the building, under the heading "The Town Hall" appears in *Chagrin Falls*, Second Printing, 2005, pages 117 to 121. Briefly, the original Greek Revival one-story structure was built in 1848. It was renovated and transformed into a two-story Eclectic/Italianate building in 1875. In 1943-44, the building suffered severe damage by fire and was partially rebuilt as the present one-story structure which, in turn, was renovated in 2011, including the installation of an ADA access ramp on the south wall. The 2014 article cited above suggests that further improvements are planned, subject to a successful fundraising campaign. The building appears to be in good condition.

Conclusions and Recommendations: The building at 83 North Main Street meets the standards of Historical Significance as defined in Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), Section 1146.05 because: a) it is more than 50 years old; and b) it is a contributing structure within the Chagrin Falls Triangle Park Commercial District listed in the National Register of Historic Places.

- The proposed change of the northeast window to a door and adding an exterior landing and steps on the north wall of the existing building would not cause an adverse effect to the building's historical significance.
- The proposed change of the northeast window to a door and adding an exterior landing and steps on the north wall of the existing building would not cause an adverse effect to proximate historically-significant structures. The proposed change would not be visible from North Main Street nor from any other nearby streets.
- A concern is that the two existing south wall doors and transoms do not appear to match and the proposed new north door does not appear to match either of the south doors. It is recommended that the proposed new door at least match the transom and door appearance of the existing southeast door and that the deteriorated southwest door, if restored, be designed to match the other two so that there is a uniform appearance within the existing hall.

End of Report

114 South Franklin Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio - 2

Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus

13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4

Cleveland, Ohio 44120

Tel/Fax: 216-577-6325 email: tedsande@ameritech.net

MEMORANDUM

Date: 27 July 2016

To: Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls, Ohio

Subject: Addendum No. 1: 114 South Franklin Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

The Issue: The owner desires to add a new one-story, wood-frame addition to the west (rear) wall; make interior changes to the west portion of the interior of the existing house; add a new shed dormer on the south side of the existing west roof; and add a new one-story, open porch and steps on the east (main) wall of the house.

Reference: a) Historical Significance Report for 114 South Franklin Street, dated 9 March 2016; b) Topographical and Boundary Survey, prepared by Howard R. Selee & Associates, Inc.; and c) architectural drawings A-1 and A-2, dated 06/21/16, prepared by Clemens Pantuso, Architects, and provided by the Village Building and Zoning Department. Site visits were made on Friday, 22 July and Tuesday, 26 July 2016.

Findings:

- The 9 March 2016 Historical Significance Report determined that the house and detached garage at 114 South Franklin Street meet the standards of Historical Significance as defined in Section 1146.05 of Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended).
- The west addition, a one-story, wood-frame, gable-roof structure facing west, is currently nearing completion. It is in scale with the existing house and it would not be visible from South Franklin Street. However, it does not resemble the west addition shown on drawing A-1, which shows a raised foundation, ribbon windows and a porch on the west wall, a different north wall configuration, and a tall chimney on the south wall.
- The proposed shed dormers on the south side of the second floor gable roof is compatible with the existing house and is not visible from South Franklin Street.
- The proposed interior changes to the west portion of the existing house do not effect the volume or appearance of the existing house.
- The proposed one-story, open porch on the east (main) wall of the existing house, facing South Franklin Street respects the scale and appearance of the house.

114 South Franklin Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio - 2

Conclusions and Recommendations:

- The proposed changes to the existing house, as described in architectural drawings A-1 and A-2, are consistent with its vernacular Queen Anne Style and would not cause an adverse effect to the house, subject to clarification of the final design of the proposed west wall addition.
- The proposed changes to the existing house, as described in architectural drawings A-1 and A-2, would not cause an adverse effect to proximate historically-significant properties, subject to clarification of the final design of the proposed west wall addition.

End of Addendum

Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus
Historic Preservation Consultant
13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4, Cleveland, OH 44120
tedsande@ameritech.net

MEMORANDUM

Date: 26 July 2016

To: Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls, Ohio

Subject: 109 East Washington Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

At the Village's request, as provided in Section 1146.03 (a) (2) paragraphs A and C of Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), I have conducted research on the property at 109 East Washington Street to determine its historical significance and reviewed the proposed plans for changes to it with respect to the potential impact that these changes would have upon the historical significance of this property and the immediate neighborhood in which it stands.

Sources Consulted: a) Chagrin Falls East Side Historic District Nomination; b) Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online; c) Ohio Historic Inventory (OHI) listings; d) Gray & Pape Photographic Survey; and e) architectural drawings A-1 through A-3 prepared by Clemens Pantuso, Architects, and provided by the Village Building and Zoning Department. Site visits were made on Friday, 22 July, and Tuesday, 26 July 2016.

The Issue: The owner desires to add a two-story, wood-frame addition to the north (rear) wall of the existing house and to modify the north portion of the existing interior to functionally relate it to the proposed addition.

Findings:

- 109 East Washington Street is located on north side of the street, the second lot west of Philomethian Street, in an R1-60 Residential District. The house appears to be unoccupied and the grounds are untended.
- This house is identified as a contributing structure within the Chagrin Falls East Side Historic District listed in the National Register of Historic Places. The National Register nomination identifies this property as the Joseph Davis House, built in 1892, which agrees with the OHI Form CUY736226 prepared by Gray & Pape in 2005. The nomination states, under Item 19, page 15: "This two and one-half story cross gabled

109 East Washington Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

Eastlake Queen Anne dwelling is constructed on an ashlar course sandstone foundation with narrow clapboard sided walls.” It also notes several front and side porch changes between 1893 and 1941. The present west side porch was constructed sometime between 1941 and 1954.

- The proposed two-story north addition continues the roof ridge of the existing building and is consistent with the vernacular Queen Anne Style of the existing house. It would not be visible from East Washington or Philomethian Streets. The overall condition of the house appears to be fair.
- A contemporary, one-story, wood-frame, two-car garage stands in the northwest corner of the property. An “L” shape unpaved, partially crushed stone surface, driveway provides access to the garage from both East Washington and Philomethian Streets.

Conclusions and Recommendations: The house at 109 East Washington Street meets the standards of Historical Significance as defined in Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), Section 1146.05 because: a) it is more than 50 years old; and b) it is listed in the National Register of Historic Places as a contributing structure within the Chagrin Falls East Side Historic district.

- The proposed north two-story addition to the existing house would not cause an adverse effect to the existing house.
- The proposed north two-story addition to the existing house would not cause an adverse effect to proximate historically-significant properties.

End of Report