

**VILLAGE OF CHAGRIN FALLS
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD MINUTES
August 4, 2015**

Members present: Koepf, Fredrickson, Barclay, King, and Clemens

Also present: Edwards, Himes,
Ted Sande, Historical Preservation Consultant

Meeting called to order at: 8:32 AM

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motioned by Mrs. Fredrickson, seconded by Mr. King, to approve minutes held July 29, 2015.
Motion passed.

- 1 Chagrin Falls Board of Education 77 East Washington Street Partial demolition of buildings**
Bob Hunt Superintendent of Chagrin Falls School, Rob Weber School Board member, Mike Stantec of Stantec Architects gave a presentation of the status of the Intermediate School. Mr. Barclay reviewed Mr. Sande Historical Significance report. Motioned by Fredrickson, seconded by King to accept Mr. Sand report. Motion passed. Mr. Barclay opened the floor for Public comment; the following spoke regarding the proposed project: Sharon Broz, Carl Maresh, and John Bourisseau . Motioned by Fredrickson, seconded by King to table the request until the ARB members have a chance to visit the school. Motion passed.

- 3 Gambrill 411 Hickory Hill New dwelling - Final**
Mike Catio presented final plans for new dwelling new dwelling. Motioned King, seconded by Fredrickson to approve with the following:
1) Lower roofline of garage
2) Reduce size of garage front elevation windows.
Motion passed. Preliminary review 4-7-2015

Newbauer 65 Olive St Addition #2 preliminary
Richard Gates architect, presented a second preliminary plan for an addition to rear of the dwelling and a new attached garage. Motioned by King, seconded by Fredrickson to approve as presented. Motion passed. Preliminary review July 7,2015

Meeting adjourned at 10:20 AM


Robert Barclay, Chairman


Date

Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus
Historic Preservation Consultant
13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4, Cleveland, OH 44120
tedsande@ameritech.net
MEMORANDUM

Date: 28 July 2015

To: Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls, Ohio

Subject: Chagrin Falls Intermediate School, Philomethian St., Chagrin Falls, Ohio

At the Village's request, as provided in Section 1146.03 (a) (2) paragraphs A and C of Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), I have conducted research on the Chagrin Falls Intermediate School on Philomethian Street to determine its historical significance and reviewed the proposed plans for changes to it with respect to the potential impact that these changes would have upon the historical significance of this property and the immediate neighborhood in which it stands.

Sources Consulted: a) *Chagrin Falls: An Ohio Village History*; b) *History of the Chagrin Falls Schools, 1833 - 1960* by Tom Mattern, 2006; c) article on the 1998-99 restoration of the Intermediate School by Yolita E. Rausche, *The Voice, Vol. 2, No. 9, Summer 2001*; d) Chagrin Falls Historical Society photographic archives; e) architectural conceptual site plan sketches dated 7/08/15 prepared by Stantec, architect, provided by the Chagrin Falls Exempted Village Schools; f) site visit and meeting with Christopher Woofter, Director of Operations and Strategic Initiatives, Chagrin Falls Exempted Village Schools, and Michael Carter, Stantec, architect, Tuesday, 23 June 2015; g) site visit and meeting with Christopher Woofter and Tom Mattern, alumnus and former teacher, Chagrin Falls Schools, on 7 July 2015; h) e-mail from Yolita E. Rausche on 14 July 2015, i) visit to the Chagrin Falls Schools Alumni Association Museum, Chagrin Falls High School, with Christopher Woofter, Thursday, 9 July 2015.

The Issue: Chagrin Falls Exempted Village Schools desires to demolish a substantial portion of the present Intermediate School campus at Philomethian Street, retaining the 1914 High School building and the 1939-40 gymnasium and auditorium, and adding new classrooms and other facilities on the west, and a student dining hall and kitchen on the east.

Findings:

- The Chagrin Falls Intermediate School is located on the west side of Philomethian Street, between Bell and East Washington Streets in a P1, Park and Institutional District.

Chagrin Falls Intermediate School, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

- There does not appear to be an Ohio Historic Inventory form for this property. A draft National Register of Historic Places Nomination was prepared in 1994, but not submitted to the Ohio Historic Preservation Office for review.
- According to information contained in *Chagrin Falls: An Ohio Village History*, and confirmed in the *History of the Chagrin Falls Schools, 1833-1960*, the property on which the Chagrin Falls Intermediate School is located has been central to the Village's public education initiatives since 1843, when the 2 and 1/2 story wood-frame Asbury Seminary was built at this site. The Seminary was acquired by the Union School (all classes, elementary through high school) in 1858, which, in 1885, relocated this building to the south and built what was called the new Chagrin Falls Union School, a 2 and 1/2 story, brick and stone, slate roof structure on the site. The architect was H. B. Smith of Cleveland. Classrooms and an auditorium were added by Cleveland architect S. R. Badgley in 1892. The Asbury Seminary building was torn down in 1893. In 1909, a one-story, wood-frame building by S. A. Whitlock for the 1st and 2nd grades was added next to the Union School. It was called the "Little White Schoolhouse".
- In 1914, Chagrin Falls High School, the Village's first high school, was added to the south and west of the then standing Union School but facing East Washington Street. It was dedicated in May 1915 and remains today as the southwest wing of the present Intermediate School. The architect was W. G. Eckles of New Castle, Pennsylvania.
- In 1927, a free-standing brick central heating plant was built at the north end of the property. It served the Union School building.
- In 1939-1940, extensive additions, designed by local architect D. M. Allison, were made to the east and north of the 1914 high school building, including an elementary school, auditorium, gymnasium, cafeteria and an industrial arts wing. The 1927 central heating plant was incorporated into the north wall of the elementary school. The new additions were funded, in part, through the Federal Works Agency of the Public Works Administration of the Roosevelt "New Deal" as part of a broad program of national recovery from the Great Depression of 1929 - 41.
- The 1885 Union School and the 1909 Little White Schoolhouse were demolished in 1939-40, thus completing the removal of all of the pre-1914 buildings on the site. The loss of these two buildings and the earlier loss of the Asbury Seminary building caused an adverse effect, individually and collectively, to the historical significance of the Philomethian Street Intermediate School site.
- Changes since 1940 include: 1) the demolition of a 1930 wood-frame home economics and cafeteria building, replaced by a playground, in 1946; 2) a third floor classroom addition over the 1940 cafeteria in 1952; 3) the 1914 high school stage and auditorium were remodeled in 1954; 4) with the move of the high school to its new location at the old Cuyahoga County Fairgrounds in 1959, the 1914-15 building became a middle school, which received miscellaneous renovations in 1972; 5) in 1989 major renovations, including window replacement, were made to the Middle School and it was rededicated in 1990; 6) in 1993, computer modifications were made at all Chagrin Falls Schools, including the Middle School; 7) in 1998 - 99, the Middle School campus was extensively renovated and restored and renamed the Chagrin Falls Intermediate

Chagrin Falls Intermediate School, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

School, housing grades 4 through 6. The project was highlighted for its historic preservation aspects in the Rausche article in *The Voice*, Summer 2001 issue.

Conclusions and Recommendations: The Chagrin Falls Intermediate School on Philomethian Street, meets the standards of Historical Significance as defined in Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), Section 1146.05 because: a) it is more than 50 years old; b) it is a key site in the history of Chagrin Falls' public education dating back to the earliest days of the Village; and c) it would qualify for listing in the National Register of Historic Places. Its two major historically-significant components are: 1) the original 1914 Chagrin Falls High School, the Village's first high school building, and 2) the 1939 - 1940 addition consisting of an elementary school, gymnasium and auditorium, financed locally and with federal funds, that represented the unique partnerships of the Roosevelt "New Deal" to counteract the economic collapse of the Great Depression.

- The proposed demolition of the 1939 - 1940 elementary school, which serves as the compositional spine of the present Intermediate School campus, a new enclosed corridor at the south wall of the auditorium and the proposed new additions would cause an adverse effect to the historical significance of the Intermediate School campus by radically changing its configuration and appearance.
- The proposed demolition of the 1939 - 1940 elementary school and the proposed new additions to the Intermediate School campus would cause an adverse effect to proximate historically-significant structures due to the extensive reconfiguration of the campus which would change its appearance by removing the 1939-1940 elementary school and adding a proposed student dining hall and kitchen addition on the east side of the campus that would partially cover the east wall of the gymnasium and obscure the historic auditorium entrance and lobby facing Philomethian Street.

End of Report