# VILLAGE OF CHAGRIN FALLS ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD MINUTES July 29, 2015

Members present: Koepf, Fredrickson, Barclay, King, and Clemens

Also present: Edwards

Meeting called to order at: 8:35 AM

### APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motioned by Mrs. Fredrickson, seconded by Mr. Barclay, to approve minutes held July 7, 2015. Motion passed.

- 1 Zupon 245 Falls Walk Window & deck alterations
  Joe Byrne contractor presented window door alterations on the side of the dwelling.
  Motioned by King, seconded by Fredrickson to approve as submitted. Motion passed.
- 2 Torrey 174 Bradley Street New detached garage
  Mr. Barclay opened the floor for public comment, no residents to comment.
  Devin Torrey homeowner presented plans for a new detached garage located in rear yard.
  Motioned by King, seconded by Fredrickson. To approve as presented. Motion passed.
- 3 Baker 49 East Summit Street Alteration & addition to detached garage

Mr. Barclay opened the floor for public comment, no residents to comment.

Mr. Barclay reviewed Mr. Sande HSR addendum. Motioned by King, seconded by Fredrickson to accept the report.

Phil Koepf architect, presented final plans for alteration to garage height, and addition to garage. Motioned Fredrickson, seconded by King to approve as submitted. Motion passed.

4 Kimberly 74 Church Street Window alterations
Mr. Barclay reviewed Mr. Sande HSR. Motioned by King, seconded by Fredrickson to accept the report. Motion passed.

Phil Koepf architect, presented window alterations. Motioned by Fredrickson, seconded by King to approve with one request:

Add horizontal bars to kitchen casement window on east elevation. Motion passed.

5 Severin 92 South Franklin Window alterations
Henry Piper, architect present a window change on the north east corner of house, replacing it
with a casement window that matches the rest of the windows.
Motioned by Fredrickson, seconded by King to approve a presented. Motion passed.

Meeting adjourned at 9:07 am.

Robert Barclay, Chairman Date

## **Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus**

13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4 Cleveland, Ohio 44120

Tel/Fax: 216-577-6325 email: <a href="mailto:tedsande@ameritech.net">tedsande@ameritech.net</a>

#### **MEMORANDUM**

Date: 21 July 2015

To: Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls,

Ohio

Subject: Addendum No. 2, 49 East Summit Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

<u>The Issue</u>: The owner desires to make alterations to the present detached two-car garage, including raising the roof and increasing its pitch in order to provide a new attic, and to build a new one-story tractor garage addition at its northeast corner.

Reference: 1) Historical Significance Report for 49 East Summit Street prepared by Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus dated; 8 August 2011; 2) Addendum No. 1 dated 12 November 2014; 3) Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online; 4) Ohio Historic Inventory (OHI) listings; 5) architectural drawings A - 1 through A - 4 prepared by P. M. Koepf, Inc., architect, provided by the Village Building and Zoning Department. A site visit, and brief discussion with the owner, was made on Monday, 20 July 2015.

## **Conclusions and Recommendations:**

- The Historical Significance Report of 8 August 2011 determined that the house at 49 East Summit Street did not meet the standards of Historical Significance as defined in Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), Section 1146.05.
- According to the Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online, the existing detached two-car garage was built in 1950. The OHI form CUY744026 for this property notes the garage but does not indicate the date it was built.
- The existing detached two-car garage is located to the northeast of the main house, both structures are set back on a high ridge that rises steeply from East Summit Street. The garage is screened from properties to the east by dense shrubbery and is not visible from East Summit Street.
- The existing detached, two-car garage at 49 East Summit Street does not meet the standards of historical significance as defined in Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), Section 1146.05, even though it is more than 50 years old, because: a) it is not listed in the National Register of Historic Places, either individually or as a contributing structure within a historic district; b) it does not appear to be associated with events or

## Addendum No. 2, 49 East Summit Street, Chagrin Falls, OH

persons significant in Village history; and c) it is not a structure that embodies distinctive local architectural features, nor is it the work of a local master.

- The proposed alterations and new addition to the existing detached garage would not cause an adverse effect to the property.
- The proposed alterations and new addition to the existing detached garage would not cause an adverse effect to proximate historically-significant structures.

End of Addendum

## Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus Historic Preservation Consultant

13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4, Cleveland, OH 44120 tedsande@ameritech.net

#### **MEMORANDUM**

Date: 21 July 2015

To: Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls,

Ohio

Subject: 74 Church Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

At the Village's request, as provided in Section 1146.03 (a) (2) paragraphs A and C of Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), I have conducted research on the property at 74 Church Street to determine its historical significance and reviewed the proposed plans for changes to it with respect to the potential impact that these changes would have upon the historical significance of this property and the immediate neighborhood in which it stands.

Sources Consulted: a) Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online; b) Ohio Historic Inventory (OHI) listings; c) Gray & Pape Photographic Survey; d) Chagrin Falls Historical Society archives; and e) architectural drawings A-1 and A-2 prepared by P. M. Koepf, Inc., Architect and provided by the Village Building and Zoning Department. A site visit was made on Monday, 20 July 2015.

<u>The Issue</u>: The owner desires to make various interior alterations, window and door alterations and partially replace exterior siding to match existing.

#### Findings:

- 74 Church Street is located at the northwest corner of the intersection of Church and Maple Streets in an R1-50 Residential District. It is within the boundary of the Chagrin Falls West Side District, a historic district listed in the National Register of Historic Places. The property pitches sharply down to the west, enabling the basement level two-car attached garage to open directly at grade onto Maple Street.
- The Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online, dates the house to 1868. OHI form CUY729726, prepared by Gray & Pape in 2005, identifies the house as the Gurden Kent Bentley house, built ca. 1874 and confirms this by reference to a *Chagrin Falls Exponent* article dated 8/20/1874, that states: "Houses Built Since 1-1-1874: G.

K. Bentley, cor Church & Maple". The 1878 Map of Chagrin Falls shows a house at this location with the Bentley name listed next to it. The 1883 Panoramic View of Chagrin Falls depicts a two-and-a-half story gable-roof house on this site that is probably the northeast wing of the present structure.

• The 2005 OHI form lists a large addition ca. 1990, presumably the present two-story west wing, a ca. 1920 porch replacement, and a ca. 1950 "rear" addition that may be the northwest extension of the porch.

Conclusions and Recommendations: The house at 74 Church Street meets the standards of Historical Significance as defined in Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), Section 1146.05 because: a) it is more than 50 years old; b) it is a contributing structure within the Chagrin Falls West Side District listed in the National Register of Historic Places; and c) although it has been added to and modified over time, it still retains visible features of its historical past in its northeast wing facing Church Street.

- The proposed changes to the 74 Church Street house would not cause an adverse effect to its historical significance.
- The proposed changes to the 74 Church Street house would not cause an adverse effect to proximate historically-significant structures.

**End of Report**