

**VILLAGE OF CHAGRIN FALLS
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD MINUTES
April 15, 2014**

Members present: Koepf, Fredrickson, Barclay, King, and Clemens

Also present: Edwards

Meeting called to order at: 8:31 AM

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motioned by Mrs. Fredrickson, seconded by Mr. Barclay, to approve minutes held April 1, 2014.
Motion passed.

Motioned by Mr. King, seconded by Mr. Barclay, to approve minutes held March 18, 2014.
Motion passed.

Artifacts	49 West Orange Street	Signage
Jeannie Shimek store owner presented two signs, one projecting sign & a wall sign. Motioned by Mrs. Fredrickson, seconded by Mr. Barclay to approve as submitted. Fredrickson: Yes, Barclay: Yes. Motion passed.		

Newell	62 East Summit	Alterations
Mr. Barclay reviewed Mr. Sande report. Motioned by Mrs. Fredrickson, seconded by Mr. Barclay to accept Mr. Sande report. Fredrickson: Yes, Barclay: Yes. King Abstained. Motion passed. Phil Koepf presented plans for kitchen & window alteration. Motioned by Mr. Barclay to approve as submitted with the following considerations; 1. Change the right window on south elevation to a four pane instead of the three pane. Seconded by Mrs. Fredrickson to approve. Fredrickson: Yes, Barclay: Yes. King abstained. Motion passed.		

Lancry	172-174 High St.	Addition
Mr. Barclay reviewed Mr. Sande report. Motioned by Mr. Mrs. Fredrickson, seconded by Mr. King to accept Mr. Sande report. Fredrickson: Yes, Barclay: Yes, King; Yes. Motion passed.		

Joel Lancry property owner presented plans for alteration and new attached garage.
Motioned by Mrs. Fredrickson to approve with the follow recommendations;
1. Add windows to west wall of garage
2. Add trim to new windows and trim to match existing.
3. Duplicate existing front porch louver design on front porch apron.
Seconded by Mr. King.
Fredrickson: Yes, Barclay: Yes, King: Yes. Motion passed.

CG II Developers

105 Bell St.

Field change

Rick Siegfried of RSA architects presented a field change renovation and addition of detached garage. Motioned by Mrs. Fredrickson to approve with the following recommendations;

1. Make garage roof details consistent with house.
2. Match window trim detail to the house.
3. Chamfer the porch post corners.

Seconded by Mr. King.

Fredrickson: Yes, Barclay: Yes, King: Yes. Motion passed.

Meeting adjourned at 9:31 AM.

Aimee A. Fredrickson 5/6/12
Robert Barclay, Chairman Date

Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus
Historic Preservation Consultant
13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4, Cleveland, OH 44120
tedsande@ameritech.net

MEMORANDUM

Date: 10 April 2014

To: Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls,
Ohio

Subject: 172-174 High Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

At the Village's request, as provided in Section 1146.03 (a) (2) paragraphs A and C of Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), I have conducted research on the property at 172-174 High Street to determine its historical significance and reviewed the proposed plans for changes to it with respect to the potential impact that these changes would have upon the historical significance of this property and the immediate neighborhood in which it stands.

Sources Consulted: a) Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online; b) Ohio Historic Inventory (OHI) listings; c) Gray & Pape Photographic Survey; and d) architectural drawings C-1, A-4, A-5 and A-7 prepared by Timothy R. Wagner, Architect, provided by the Village Building and Zoning Department. A site visit was made on Tuesday, 8 April 2014.

The Issue: The owner desires to extensively rehabilitate and partially restore the existing two-family house and to add a new attached garage.

Findings:

- 172-174 High Street is located on the south side of the street, seven lots east of North Street in an R1-60 Residential District. The site slopes steeply south down to Mill Street.
- According to the Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online, the house and garage were built in 1895. However, OHI form CUY703626 dates the house to ca. 1857 and the rear (south) addition and garage to ca. 1940-50, which seems more likely.

172-174 High Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

- The one-and-a-half story wood-frame, two-family house is capped by a Mansard roof with dormer windows and the first floor has an open porch along its north and west walls.
- Stylistically, this house is a Second Empire design, popular in this country from 1855 to 1885 (See McAlester: *A Field Guide to American Houses*, pp. 240-253). Although the Mansard roof is usually associated with taller buildings, it is not uncommon to find the one-and-a-half story version similar to this one.
- The mid-20th century south addition is a contemporary structure that does not reflect any of the stylistic features of the original main house.
- The house is in poor condition with deteriorated asphalt roof shingles, vinyl siding and wood trim.
- Concerns: 1. How will the vinyl siding be repaired or, if necessary, replaced to maintain a uniform appearance? 2. The proposed new gravel driveway cuts sharply down approximately 8.5 feet from High Street in a relatively short distance to the garage apron. How are the east and west banks to be stabilized to avoid erosion?

Conclusions and Recommendations: The house at 172-174 High Street meets the standards of Historical Significance as defined in Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), Section 1146.05 because: a) it is more than 50 years old; b) the main (north) portion of the house seems to retain much of its original historical configuration, c) the main (north) portion is a good example of the Second Empire style which was popular in the Village during the latter half of the 19th century; and d) despite its many changes, it would be eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places as a contributing structure within a proposed future National Register historic district.

- The proposed rehabilitation/restoration of the house would not cause an adverse effect to the existing house.
- The proposed rehabilitation/restoration of the house would not cause an adverse effect to proximate historically-significant structures.
- The proposed new garage addition would not cause an adverse effect to the historical significance of the existing house nor would it adversely effect proximate historically-significant structures.

End of Report

Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus
Historic Preservation Consultant
13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4, Cleveland, OH 44120
tedsande@ameritech.net

MEMORANDUM

Date: 9 April 2014

To: Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls,
Ohio

Subject: 62 East Summit Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

At the Village's request, as provided in Section 1146.03 (a) (2) paragraphs A and C of Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), I have conducted research on the property at 62 East Summit Street to determine its historical significance and reviewed the proposed plans for changes to it with respect to the potential impact that these changes would have upon the historical significance of this property and the immediate neighborhood in which it stands.

Sources Consulted: a) Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online; b) Ohio Historic Inventory (OHI) listings; c) Gray & Pape Photographic Survey; and d) architectural drawings and specifications sheets A-1 through A-3 prepared by Philip M. Koepf, Architect, and provided by the Village Building and Zoning Department. A site visit was made on Tuesday, 8 April 2014.

The Issue: The owner desires to make minor window modifications to the south and east exterior walls to accommodate interior plan refinements.

Findings:

- 62 East Summit Street is located on the south side of the street eight lots east of North Main Street in an R1-60 Residential District. The site slopes steeply to the south.
- According to the Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online, the house was built in 1920. OHI form CUY742326 dates the house to ca.1920.
- The OHI form classifies the house as Dutch Colonial Revival and identifies the roof as Gambrel, neither of which is correct. In Virginia & Lee McAlester's *A Field Guide to American Houses*, NY: Alfred A. Knopf, 1984, they note, on page 361, that the jerkinhead, clipped gable, roof type, which is a prominent feature of this house, reflects

62 East Summit Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

a 20th-century Eclectic style sometimes referred to as “Germanic Cottage”, which seems accurate in this case as seen in the east and west clipped gables and the north dormer window of the house. Since the house shows other influences as well, notably the Arts and Crafts 6 over 1 window pattern, I would classify it stylistically as a vernacular Arts and Crafts Germanic Cottage.

- This one-and-a-half story wood-frame house is smaller than the wood-frame houses of varying styles in its immediate vicinity. It appears to be in good to fair condition.

Conclusions and Recommendations: The house at 62 East Summit Street meets the standards of Historical Significance as defined in Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), Section 1146.05 because: a) it is more than 50 years old; b) it represents a vernacular architectural style that is relatively rare in the Village but appears to retain much of its original configuration; and c) it would qualify as a contributing structure within a potential future National Register historic district.

- The proposed minor modifications to the south and east walls would not cause an adverse effect to the historical significance of this house.
- The proposed minor modifications to the south and east walls would not cause an adverse effect to proximate historically-significant structures.

End of Report