

**VILLAGE OF CHAGRIN FALLS
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD MINUTES
March 18, 2014**

Members present: Koepf, Barclay, King, Clemens, Fredrickson absent.

Also present: Edwards

Meeting called to order at: 8:35 AM

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motioned by Mr. Barclay, seconded by Mr. King to approve minutes held March 4, 2014.
Motion passed.

- 1 **Rosen** **30 Church St** **Detached garage addition**
Mr. Barclay reviewed Mr. Sande report. Moved by Mr. King, to accept Mr. Sande report, seconded by Mr. Barclay. Roll call: Barclay: Yes, King: Yes Motion passed.
Steve Ciciretto presented plans for a 120 SF addition to an existing detached garage, and alteration to front porch & sunroom. Moved by Mr. King to approve as submitted with the understanding that they pay attention to the trellis on detached garage. Seconded by Mr. Barclay. Roll Call: Barclay; Yes, King; Yes. Motion passed.

- 2 **A&E real Estate** **31 North Franklin St** **Alteration to front elevation**
Mr. Barclay reviewed Mr. Sande report. Moved by Mr. King to accept Mr. Sande report, seconded by Mr. Barclay. Roll call: Barclay; Yes, Kin; Yes.
Rick Siegfried and Larry Shibley presented plans for exterior alterations to front of store façade. Moved by Mr. King, seconded by Mr. Barclay to approve as submitted.
Roll call: Barclay; Yes, King: Yes. Motion passed.

- 3 **Livingston** **220 Bramley St. S/L 11** **New dwelling - Preliminary**
Paul Papageorge of Alexandra Fine Homes presented preliminary plans for a new dwelling. Moved by Mr. Barclay, to grant the preliminary approval and restudy the stone elevations. Seconded by Mr. King. Motion passed. Roll call: Barclay; Yes, King; Yes. Motion passed.

- 4 **Elementarie Baby Boutique** **100 North Main** **Signage /awnings**
Rachel Levinson applicant, presented six awnings along the North Main Street side of building. Moved by Mr. King to approve as submitted, seconded by Mr. King.
Roll call: Barclay: Yes, King: Yes. Motion passed. 2014-782

Meeting adjourned at 9:16 AM


Robert Barclay, Chairman 4/15/14
Date

Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus
Historic Preservation Consultant
13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4, Cleveland, OH 44120
tedsande@ameritech.net

MEMORANDUM

Date: 12 March 2014

To: Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls,
Ohio

Subject: 30 Church Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

At the Village's request, as provided in Section 1146.03 (a) (2) paragraphs A and C of Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), I have conducted research on the property at 30 Church Street to determine its historical significance and reviewed the proposed plans for changes to it with respect to the potential impact that these changes would have upon the historical significance of this property and the immediate neighborhood in which it stands.

Sources Consulted: a) Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online; b) Ohio Historic Inventory (OHI) listings; c) Gray & Pape Photographic Survey; d) Chagrin Falls Historical Society Archives; e) National Register of Historic Places Nomination for the Chagrin Falls West Side District; and f) architectural drawings A-1 Plot Plan and A-2 First Floor Plan for the detached Garage addition; X-1 Section and Plot Plan and A-1 - A-3, floor plans, elevations and photographs for the proposed new porch, prepared by Stephen Ciciretto, AIA, Architect, and provided by the Village Building and Zoning Department. A site visit was made on Monday, 10 March 2014.

The Issue: The owner desires: a) to add a small addition to the northeast portion of the north wall of the detached garage and b) to add open, roofed, porches to the first and second floors on the east wall of the house.

Findings:

- 30 Church Street is located on the west side of the street, opposite the Center Street intersection, in an R1-50 Residential District.
- This property is within the Chagrin Falls West Side District, a historic district listed in the National Register of Historic Places. At the time that the National Register

30 Church Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

Nomination was prepared in 1973, it was considered to be a contributing structure within the potential district.

- According to the Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online, and OHI form CUY695126, prepared by Gray & Pape in 2005, the original house was built ca. 1858.
- The OHI form notes that: "This house has undergone major alterations dating to ca. 1980-2000. Most of the changes, especially the front sunroom and the second story entrance [rear], have been insensitive and have completely compromised the historic integrity of the house."
- The 1883 *Panoramic View of Chagrin Falls* shows at this location a compound one and two story house, with a moderate slope, cross-gable roof, facing Church Street. It appears to have been a typical, vernacular "Western Reserve" style Classical-Revival structure.
- A photograph dating from the late 1970s in the collection of the Chagrin Falls Historical Society shows that by the mid-20th century the house, then painted white, had been transformed into a steep roof, cross-gable structure, the main entrance still facing Church Street. There appear to have been other changes to the roof line and the addition of an open east porch to the south of the main entrance gable that were made probably in the 1920-1940 period, which gave the house a typical 20th-century suburban residential appearance. Additions or modifications to the west (rear) may have been done at this time as well.
- The present house is the result of further additions and modifications that occurred, as noted above, during the 1980-2000 period. On the east (main) wall visible from Church Street, these include the modification of the entrance gable with an open porch on the first floor and a balcony above; the replacement of the second floor windows with one large, arched sliding-door opening and the centering of the entrance door at the first floor level; an enclosed porch to the south of the main entrance; a triangular dormer above the porch; and a two-story turret at the northeast corner. Additional changes were made to the west (rear) of the house. Apparently, it was during this time that the exterior wood shingles were painted their present blue color.
- The existing one and a half story, woodframe, detached 3-car garage was built in 1963, according to the Cuyahoga County Auditor Property information, online.

Conclusions and Recommendations: The house and detached garage do not meet the standards of Historical Significance as defined in Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), Section 1146.05 because: a) although the original house on this site dates to the mid-19th century, it has undergone two major alterations, several additions and extensive

30 Church Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

remodeling that have removed or obscured the original character defining features of the 1850s house; b) if the present Chagrin Falls West Side District were resurveyed today, it is doubtful that this house would qualify as a contributing structure within the historic district, even if the historical period of significance were extended well into the 20th century; and c) the detached garage is a simple, mid- 20th century woodframe, gable-roof structure that does not appear to be associated with events or persons significant in Village history

The adverse effect (i. e. loss or significant modification of historical materials and configuration of the ca. 1858 original house) occurred during the presumed 1920-1940 renovation and, more profoundly, during the 1980-2000 transformation of the house to its present Eastlake or Queen Anne late 19th-century appearance.

- The proposed east porches, as defined in the architectural drawings X-1, A-1 - A-3, cited above, would not cause any further adverse effect to the historical significance of this house. In fact the proposed porches would serve to bring together the present disparate elements of the east wall into a more plausible historical replica.
- The proposed east porches, as defined in the architectural drawings X-1, A-1 - A-3, cited above, would not cause any further adverse effect to proximate historically-significant structures.
- The propose minor addition to the north wall of the detached garage as defined in architectural drawings A-1 and A-2 would not cause an adverse effect to the historical significance of this structure nor adversely effect proximate historically-significant structures.

End of Report

30 Church Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus
Historic Preservation Consultant
13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4, Cleveland, OH 44120
tedsande@ameritech.net

MEMORANDUM

Date: 11 March 2014

To: Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls,
Ohio

Subject: 31 North Franklin Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

At the Village's request, as provided in Section 1146.03 (a) (2) paragraphs A and C of Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), I have conducted research on the property at 31 North Franklin Street to determine its historical significance and reviewed the proposed plans for changes to it with respect to the potential impact that these changes would have upon the historical significance of this property and the immediate neighborhood in which it stands.

Sources Consulted: a) Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online; b) Ohio Historic Inventory (OHI) listings; c) Gray & Pape Photographic Survey; d) National Register of Historic Places Nomination for the Chagrin Falls Triangle Park Commercial District; e) Chagrin Falls Historical Society Archives; f) *Chagrin Falls: An Ohio Village History*; and g) architectural drawings 1 and 2 prepared by RSA, Architects, showing current photographs of the east storefront and an elevation of the proposed remodeling of the east wall provided by the Village Building and Zoning Department. A site visit was made on Monday, 10 March 2014.

The Issue: The owner desires to remodel the first floor storefront, including a new business sign over the storefront, window framing modifications, a new wood main entrance door and new storefront window base panels.

Findings:

- 31 North Franklin Street is located in a historic row of two-story brick and stone commercial buildings along the west side of the street. Its north wall defines where North Franklin Street merges into North Main Street and the block turns from north to northwest. It is in the CS Central Shopping District.

31 North Franklin Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

- 31 North Franklin Street is a contributing part of this historic row, which is an integral part of the Chagrin Falls Triangle Park Commercial District listed in the National Register of Historic Places.
- The second floor with its two arched windows and brick corbeled frieze and cornice retains its late 19th century configuration. However the brick has been painted white.
- The first floor storefront was originally shielded by a shed roof canopy with the business sign mounted above, but otherwise the large windows flanking the central entrance appears to retain the original storefront configuration. (See 1895 photo, *Chagrin Falls*, page 150.) Above the main-entrance wood door is a decorative stained glass window.
- The finish surfaces of the exterior business sign panel and wood storefront window bases have been stripped away revealing the under surfaces.

Conclusions and Recommendations: the store at 31 North Franklin Street meets the standards of Historical Significance as defined in Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), Section 1146.05 because it is an integral part of a commercial block that is a contributing structure within a National Register of Historic Places historic district.

- The proposed remodeling of the storefront as described in architectural drawing 2 does not significantly alter the existing configuration. The proposed remodeling would not have an adverse effect upon the historical significance of the store.
- The proposed remodeling, as described in architectural drawing 2, would not have an adverse effect upon proximate historically-significant structures.

End of Report

31 North Franklin Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio