

**VILLAGE OF CHAGRIN FALLS
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD MINUTES
September 17, 2013**

Members present: Koepf, Fredrickson, King and Clemens, Barclay absent.
Also present: Edwards

Meeting called to order at: 8:30 a.m. by Mrs. Fredrickson.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of the September 3, 2013 were tabled until November.

- 1 Garvey 70 East Washington St. Addition**
Review of Mr. Sande report, moved by Mr. King, seconded by Mrs. Fredrickson motion passed.
Kathryn & Mike Garvey, along with George Clemens, AIA presented plans for addition and widening attached garage. Moved by Mr. King, seconded by Mrs. Fredrickson: Fredrickson: Yes, King: Yes.
- 2 Gutierrez 300 Falls Walk Field change**
Gary Spath of Manor brook homes presented a field change elimination of side porch, on north elevation & redesign of rear deck.. Moved by Mr. King, seconded by Mrs. Fredrickson King: Yes, Fredrickson: Yes.
- 3 Manorbrook Homes 110 Pear Tree Ct. SL #25 New Dwelling**
Gary Spath of Manor brook homes presented preliminary plans for a new dwelling. Notices sent to adjacent property owners with no comments received back. Discussion: change front elevation with relationship of front porch, entry and garage doors. No formal action taken, advised applicant to revise and resubmit for final.
- 4 Wirbel 71 Locust Ln Addition**
Tom Wirbel, property owner, and Rick Siegfried AIA presented plans for a porch infill on the rear of the house. Discussion: Consider reducing back eave overhang. Moved by Mrs. Fredrickson seconded by Mr. King. Fredrickson: Yes, King: Yes.
- 5 Fun Haus Holdings 91 Olive St Siding**
Review of Mr. Sande report, moved by Mrs. Fredrickson, seconded by Mr. King. Fredrickson; Yes, King; Yes. Melissa Hauserman, property owner presented plans for siding of the dormer. Discussion: recommend replacing dormer siding with a wood cedar siding, either flush or lap siding. Beth Skeel of the Historical Society presented photo's showing flush siding. Applicant wishes not to make any changes to the other siding. Moved by Mrs. Fredrickson, seconded by Mr. King. King Yes, Fredrickson Yes.
- 6 The Methodist Church 20 S. Franklin St. Signage**
Dave Toole presented plans for a wall sign with the approved Methodist Church logo design. To be place approx. 12' from grade and placed between two windows. Moved by Mrs. Fredrickson, seconded by Mr. King to approve as submitted. Fredrickson: Yes, King: Yes.
- 7 Collins 215 Bramley Ct New dwelling - final**
Paul Papageroge, of Alexandria Fine Homes presented final plans for new dwelling. Discussion: Changed exterior to Tudor, recommend continuing tudor style around all sides, resubmit with changes for the October 1st meeting no formal action taken.
(Preliminary review 9/3/2013)

8. Rick Siegfried AIA spoke with the board in regards to window change at 47 E. Orange St. discussed briefly with the board on possible window change. Discussion: Recommend keeping existing arches over the windows and pursue options for custom windows in addition to match existing. No formal action taken.

Meeting adjourned at 10:01 A.M.


Lisa Fredrickson, Oct. 1, 2013
Date:

Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus
Historic Preservation Consultant
13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4, Cleveland, OH 44120
tedsande@ameritech.net

MEMORANDUM

Date: 27 August 2013

To: Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls, Ohio

Subject: 70 East Washington Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

At the Village's request, as provided in Section 1146.03 (a) (2) paragraphs A and C of Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), I have conducted research on the property at 70 East Washington Street to determine its historical significance and reviewed the proposed plans for changes to it with respect to the potential impact that these changes would have upon the historical significance of this property and the immediate neighborhood in which it stands.

Sources Consulted: a) Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online; b) Ohio Historic Inventory (OHI) listings; c) Gray & Pape Photographic Survey; and d) a site plan and architectural drawings A-1 and A-3 prepared by George Clemens, Architect, provided by the Village Building and Zoning Department. A site visit was made on Saturday, 24 August 2013.

The Issue: The owner desires to remove an existing wood deck on the east and south sides of the house and to replace it with a new wood-frame porch and extension of the south wall at the garage and first floor levels. A new door and window will be installed on the east wall at the first floor level, north of the new porch.

Findings:

- 70 East Washington Street is located on the south side of the street, six lots east of South Main Street in an R1-60 Residential District. The site slopes sharply down to the south property line.
- According to the Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online, the house was built in 1898 and the basement garage dates to 1875. The OHI form (CUY765426) prepared by Gray and Pape in 2005 gives a ca.1898 date for the house but does not note

70 East Washington Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

any earlier structure on the site. It does indicate that an addition to the south (rear) of the house was made ca. 1990.

- This wood-frame, stone-foundation, house is two-stories tall on East Washington Street, however the steep slope of the site to the south allows for the basement to open at grade.
- The house is a good example of a vernacular Queen Anne style. The present wood deck was apparently built in the post-WWII period and may date to the ca. 1990 south addition.
- The proposed new open porch is compatible with the Queen Anne style of the house.

Conclusions and Recommendations: The house at 70 East Washington Street meets the standards of Historical Significance as defined in Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), Section 1146.05 because: a) it is more than 50 years old; b) it is a good example of a vernacular Queen Anne style popular in the Village during the late 19th and early 20th centuries; and c) it would qualify for listing in the National Register of Historic Places as a contributing structure within a potential future historic district.

- The proposed new open porch and other modifications to the south and east walls of this house would not cause an adverse effect to its historical significance.
- The proposed new open porch and other modifications to the south and east walls of this house are not visible from East Washington Street and would not cause an adverse effect to proximate historically-significant structures.

End of Report

Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus
Historic Preservation Consultant
13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4, Cleveland, OH 44120
tedsande@ameritech.net

MEMORANDUM

Date: 8 October 2009

To: Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls, Ohio

Subject: 71 Locust Lane, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

At the Village's request, as provided in Section 1146.03 (2) paragraphs A and C of Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), I have conducted research on the 71 Locust Lane property to determine its historical significance and reviewed the proposed plans for changes to it with respect to the potential impact that these changes would have upon the historical significance of this property and the immediate neighborhood in which it stands.

Sources Consulted: a) Cuyahoga County Archives Real Estate Appraisal/Reappraisal Records; b) Ohio Historic Inventory listings; c) Gray & Pape Photographic Survey; d) Drawings A-1 and A-2, dated 9.21.09 showing a site plan, specifications, elevations and selected details of the proposed project, prepared by George Clemens, Architect, provided by the Village Building and Zoning Department. A site visit was made on 8 October 2009.

The Issue: The owner desires to add a small, one-story addition to the back (north side) of the present house.

Findings:

- 71 Locust Lane is located on the north side of a cul-de-sac, four lots east of North Main Street in the north part of the Village. This neighborhood is zoned R1-100 and is predominantly composed of houses built after World War II.
- Cuyahoga County Real Estate records indicate that the house was built in 1957. It appears to have been added to on the west sometime after a 1964 reappraisal.
- The two-story, wood-frame structure is set back from the street and stands on a masonry, partially-exposed basement that is built into the hillside, providing a garage facing south toward Locust Lane. The main roof is a hip; secondary roofs are gables. The site is bordered by woodland and dense vegetation on the west, north and south.

- The style of the house is a vernacular Modern¹, commonly called Ranch, which proliferated in suburban developments throughout the country from the late 1940s to the 1970s.
- The 71 Locust Lane property is not listed in the Ohio Historic Inventory; nor is it listed in the National Register of Historic Places, either individually or as a contributing structure within a historic district. It is not included in the Gray & Pape architectural or photographic surveys.

Conclusions and Recommendations:

- 71 Locust Lane does not meet the standards of Historical Significance as defined in Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), Section 1146.05 because: a) even though it is more than 50 years old, it is not listed in the National Register of Historic Places; b) it does not appear to be associated with events or persons significant in the Village's past; and c) it does not embody distinctive or unique artistic, architectural or structural characteristics, nor does it represent the work of a local master.
- The proposed addition to the north side of the house would not cause an adverse effect to the historical significance of the present house.
- The proposed addition to the north side of the house is not visible from Locust Lane and would not cause an adverse effect to proximate buildings of historical significance.

End of Report

¹ Virginia & Lee McAlester: *A Field Guide to American Houses*. NY: Knopf, 1984. pp476-485.

Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus
Historic Preservation Consultant
13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4, Cleveland, OH 44120
tedsande@ameritech.net

MEMORANDUM

Date: 11 September 2013

To: Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls,
Ohio

Subject: 91 Olive Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

At the Village's request, as provided in Section 1146.03 (a) (2) paragraphs A and C of Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), I have conducted research on the property at 91 Olive Street to determine its historical significance and reviewed the proposed plans for changes to it with respect to the potential impact that these changes would have upon the historical significance of this property and the immediate neighborhood in which it stands.

Sources Consulted: a) Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online; b) Ohio Historic Inventory (OHI) listings; c) Gray & Pape Photographic Survey; d) Chagrin Falls Historical Society Archives; e) *Chagrin Falls, An Ohio Village History*; and f) two photographs provided by the Village Building and Zoning Department. A site visit was made on Tuesday, 10 September 2013.

The Issue: The owner desires to repair and re-side the dormers and exterior walls of the existing house with a wood lap or hardy board siding.

Findings:

- 91 Olive Street stands on the south side of the street, the third lot east of Robens Court, in an R1-50 Residential District.

- The one and a half story wood-frame house is in poor condition and appears to be undergoing an extensive rehabilitation. There are similar small-scale houses and cottages of various styles along both sides of this street.

- According to a typescript, in the Historical Society Archives, of a talk given by Annie Gumprecht in February 1986 that discussed buildings relocated in Chagrin Falls, 91 Olive Street was moved to this site from South Franklin Street when the Masonic Temple was built in 1922.

91 Olive Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

- OHI form CUY749626, prepared by Gray & Pape in 2005, 91 Olive Street is known as the Henry Church, Jr. House and dates to ca.1860. The Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online, lists the house as built in 1860 and the detached garage in 1900. As noted above, the house was relocated to its present site in 1922.
- There appear to be at least four different siding materials used on the dormers and exterior walls of the house. Of particular interest is the north (main) wall which retains evidence of its original Greek Revival design with its flat, matched boards in the pediment and on the north porch wall and Doric pilasters. The projecting northeast segmented bay appears to date from the late 19th century and the window in the north pediment is clearly Craftsman Style that may have been inserted after the 1922 relocation. The dormers may have been added then as well.
- Henry Church, Jr is identified in *Chagrin Falls, An Ohio Village History* as a blacksmith, sculptor and painter. He seems to have been a much admired Village character, active in its cultural and civic activities for more than 50 years. His father and his family were important, contributive, members of the Village community during its formative years.

Conclusions and Recommendations: The house at 91 Olive Street meets the standards of Historical Significance as defined in Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), Section 1146.05 because: a) it is more than 50 years old; b) although it has been moved from its original site, the house represents a person and family important in Village history; and c) the house would meet the standards for listing in the National Register of Historic Places as a contributing structure within a possible future National Register historic district.

- The proposed re-siding of the existing dormers and exterior walls would not cause an adverse effect to the historical significance of the house if the existing deteriorated siding is removed first and replaced by the new siding. If possible, the north pediment and porch siding should be repaired to preserve what appears to be original siding. If replacement is the only alternative, it should be done in such a way as to retain the historical appearance.
- The proposed re-siding of the existing dormers and exterior walls, if done as suggested above, would not cause an adverse effect to proximate historically-significant structures.

End of Report

91 Olive Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio