VILLAGE OF CHAGRIN FALLS ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD MINUTES

September 3, 2013

Members present: Koepf, Fredrickson, Barclay, and Clemens, King absent.

Also present: Edwards.

Meeting called to order at: 8:30 a.m. by Mr. Barclay.

The minutes of the August 20, 2013 were approved.

Snyder

47 Hall St

Vinvl siding

Review of Mr. Sande Historical Significance Report Moved by Mrs. Fredrickson, seconded by Mr. Barclay to accept Mr. Sande report. Fredrickson: Yes. Barclay: Yes.

No one present for the applicant according to the submission applicant wishes to vinyl side detached garage, matching the siding on the house. Moved by Mrs. Fredrickson, seconded by Mr. Barclay to approve with the following conditions;

1. Maintain trim on existing garage with wide trim.

2. Match Dutch lap siding.

Fredrickson: Yes. Barclay: Yes.

(submission 2013-399-400)

Dickard

431 Bell St

Alteration

Review of Mr. Sande Historical Significance Report. Moved by Mrs. Fredrickson, seconded by Mr. Barclay to accept Mr. Sande report. Barclay: Yes, Fredrickson: Yes.

Ann Dunning AIA, submitted plans to turn an existing screen porch into a four seasons room.

Motion by Mr. Barclay, seconded by Mrs. Fredrickson to approve as submitted

Fredrickson: Yes. Barclay: Yes.

(submission 2013-403-404)

Eberlein

31 Walnut St

Fence

Mrs. Eberlein applicant, wishes to replace an existing picket fence with board on board fence at the corner of Masonic Alley & Center St. Mr. Edwards, zoning inspector mentioned that there is a visibility issue, the zoning code requires that there be a twenty five foot set back from the corner where the two fences intersect. Lieutenant Dacek from the police department review the area for the proposed fence and concurs that the fence needs to be no higher than forty two inches due to the pedestrian sidewalk. Mrs. Eberlein wishes to rethink here proposal and asked that it be tabled.

Moved by Mr. Barclay, seconded by Mrs. Fredrickson.

Fredrickson: Yes.

Barclay: Yes.

Eberlin 31 Walnut St Accessory building

Mr. Barclay reviewed the addendum to HSR. Moved by Mr. Barclay, seconded by Mrs. Fredrickson to accept the report. Fredrickson: Yes. Barclay: Yes.

George Clemens AIA, presented plans for the carport and explained the reason why this will need a variance and have applied to the Board of Zoning Appeals.

Moved by Mrs. Frederickson, seconded by Mr. Barclay to approve as submitted and BZA grant the variance.

Fredrickson: Yes Barclay: Yes.

(submission 2013-406)

Wouters 122 Walnut St Addition

Review of Mr. Sande Historical Significance Report Moved by Mrs. Fredrickson, seconded by Mr. Barclay to accept the HSR. Motion passed.

Dave Jansen AIA presented plans for dormer addition Moved by Mrs. Fredrickson, seconded by Mr. Barclay to approved as presented.

Fredrickson: Yes. Barclay: Yes.

Collins 215 Bramley Ct SL #1 Preliminary – new dwelling

Paul Papageorge of Alexandra Fine Homes, presented preliminary plans for a new dwelling. Moved by Mrs. Fredrickson, Seconded by Mr. Barclay, to approve with the following comments:

- 1. Improve detail on the bottom of the eaves.
- 2. More detail on front entrance.
- 3. Balance windows above garage to occupy more of the dormers.

Fredrickson: Yes. Barclay: Yes

Click It 16 S. Main signage

Mrs. Halow of Click-It, presented wall sign and explained the reason why that the approved hanging sign was not going to work as submitted and presented a wall sign which will to be placed to the left side of the door. Moved by Mrs. Fredrickson, seconded by Mr. Barclay.

Fredrickson: Yes. Barclay: Yes.

CG II Developers 105 Bell St. Field change

Rick Siegfried AIA of RSA Architects presented a field change to the original approved drawings that were approved back in October. Moved by Mr. Barclay, seconded by Mrs. Fredrickson to approve the field change as submitted.

Fredrickson: Yes. Barclay: Yes.

Scarl 305 Solon Rd Final – new dwelling

Greg Brown of Wayne Homes, & Tim Scarl property owner, submitted final plans for new dwelling. Moved by Mrs. Fredrickson, seconded by Mr. Barclay to approve as presented.

Fredrickson: Yes. Barclay: Yes.

Bob Darden of Spillway spoke with the board as a follow with the email that was sent last week regarding information from OHPS. His design team plans on going back to OHPS and see if they will consider making a change in material.

Meeting adjourned at 10:50AM

Robert Barclay, Chairman

hce

13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4, Cleveland, OH 44120 tedsande@ameritech.net

MEMORANDUM

Date: 14 August 2013

To: Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls,

Ohio

Subject: 47 Hall Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

At the Village's request, as provided in Section 1146.03 (a) (2) paragraphs A and C of Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), I have conducted research on the property at 47 Hall Street to determine its historical significance and reviewed the proposed plans for changes to it with respect to the potential impact that these changes would have upon the historical significance of this property and the immediate neighborhood in which it stands.

Sources Consulted: a) Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online; b) Ohio Historic Inventory (OHI) listings; and c) Gray & Pape Photographic Survey. A site visit was made on Sunday, 11 August 2013.

The Issue: The owner desires to re-sheath the existing detached garage and install new trim and gutters to match the existing aluminum/vinyl siding of the house.

- 47 Hall Street is located on the south side of the street, four lots west of Walnut Street in an R1-50 Residential District.
- The house is a Colonial Revival vernacular design.
- The existing garage, which is compatible in vernacular design with the exiting house, stands to the southwest of the house, deeply set back from Hall Street.
- According to the Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online, the house and detached garage were built in 1920. OHI form CUY718126, prepared by Gray & Pape in 2005, dates the house to ca. 1911 with unspecified alterations ca. 1980-90. It is known as the John White house. White's sister Jennie Goodwin lived next door at 53 Hall Street.

Conclusions and Recommendations: The house at 47 Hall Street meets the standards of Historical Significance as defined in Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), Section 1146.05 because: a) it is more than 50 years old; b) although it has been altered and sheathed in aluminum or vinyl siding, it still retains its original Colonial Revival configuration and would be a contributing structure in a potential future historic district; and c) the property is associated with the White and Goodwin families who were prominent in 19th and early 20th century Village history.

- The proposed re-sheathing of the detached garage would not cause an adverse effect to its historical significance.
- The proposed re-sheathing of the detached garage would not cause an adverse effect to proximate historically-significant structures.

13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4, Cleveland, OH 44120 tedsande@ameritech.net

MEMORANDUM

Date: 27 August 2013

To: Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls,

Ohio

Subject: 431 Bell Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

At the Village's request, as provided in Section 1146.03 (a) (2) paragraphs A and C of Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), I have conducted research on the property at 431 Bell Street to determine its historical significance and reviewed the proposed plans for changes to it with respect to the potential impact that these changes would have upon the historical significance of this property and the immediate neighborhood in which it stands.

Sources Consulted: a) Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online; b) Ohio Historic Inventory (OHI) listings; c) Gray & Pape Photographic Survey; and d) architectural drawings C1 and A1 through A4 prepared by Ann M. Dunning, AIA Inc., provided by the Village Building and Zoning Department. A site visit was made on Saturday, 24 August 2013.

<u>The Issue</u>: The owner desires to enclose an existing screen porch on the north side of the house to convert it into a sun room.

- 431 Bell Street is located on the north side of the street, the second lot east of Walters Road, in an R1-60 Residential District.
- According to the Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online, for Permanent Parcel Number 932-13-016, the house and detached garage were built in 1920. OHI form CUY758326 prepared by Gray and Pape in 2005 dates the house to ca. 1920 and dates the present north two-story addition to ca. 1990.
- The present north addition with its screen porch is not visible from Bell Street.

Conclusions and Recommendations: The house at 431 Bell Street meets the standards of Historical Significance as defined in Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), Section 1146.05 because: a) it is more than 50 years old; b) the house is a simple, vernacular Craftsman-Bungalow style popular in the Village during the early 20th century; and c) the house would qualify for listing in the National Register of Historic Places as a contributing structure within a potential future historic district.

- The proposed enclosure of the north screen porch would not cause an adverse effect to the house at 431 Bell Street.
- The proposed enclosure of the north screen porch would not cause an adverse effect to proximate historically-significant structures.

Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus

13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4 Cleveland, Ohio 44120

Tel/Fax: 216-577-6325, email: tedsande@ameritech.net

MEMORANDUM

Date:

27 August 2013

To:

Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls.

Ohio

Subject:

31 Walnut Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio, Addendum No. 1

<u>The Issue</u>: The owner desires to build a detached, one-story carport on the east (rear) portion of the property facing an alley.

Reference: 1) Historical Significance Report for prepared by Ted Sande, AIA Emeritus dated 10 August 2011; 2) Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information online; and 3) a site plan prepared by Howard R. Selee, and architectural drawings A-1 and A-2 prepared by George Clemens, Architect, and provided by the Village Building and Zoning Department. A site visit was made on Saturday, 24 August 2013.

Conclusions and Recommendations:

- Due to trees and shrubs at the southeast corner of the site and structures to the east along Center Street, the proposed carport would be largely obscured from view from the public right-of-way.
- The proposed detached, one-story carport is designed with a gable roof, supported on four tapered wood columns, that is consistent with the vernacular Craftsman-style design of the house.
- The proposed carport would not have an adverse effect on the historical significance of the house; nor would it have an adverse effect on proximate historically-significant property.

End of Addendum

13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4, Cleveland, OH 44120 tedsande@ameritech.net

MEMORANDUM

Date: 10 August 2011

To: Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls.

Ohio

Subject: 31 Walnut Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

At the Village's request, as provided in Section 1146.03 (2) paragraphs A and C of Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), I have conducted research on the 31 Walnut Street property to determine its historical significance and reviewed the proposed plans for changes to it with respect to the potential impact that these changes would have upon the historical significance of this property and the immediate neighborhood in which it stands.

<u>Sources Consulted</u>: a) Cuyahoga County Archives Real Estate Appraisal/Reappraisal Records; b) Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online; c) Ohio Historic Inventory listings; d) Gray & Pape Photographic Survey; e) Ohio Historic Preservation Office; and f) architectural drawing A-3, showing elevations, prepared by George Clemens, Architect, dated 7/19/2011 and provided by the Village Building and Zoning Department. A site visit was made on Friday, 5 August 2011.

The Issue: The owner desires to add a one-story mud room on the east (rear) side of the present house that would join the main house and the detached shed to the east, which would be converted to a guest room. Further, the present west (front) Colonial Revival porch would be removed and replaced with a new Craftsman-style porch. (See attached photograph.)

- 31 Walnut Street is located at the northeast corner of Walnut and Center Streets in an R1-50 Residential District. The house is placed close to the north property line which allows for a wide lawn and garden along Center Street.
- According to the Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, the 31 Walnut Street house and detached garage were built in 1925. The County real estate records provide an estimated date for the house as 1910. A Gray & Pape Ohio

- Historic Inventory form dates the house to ca. 1920, which is supported by tax duplicate records and an article in the Chagrin Falls *Exponent* of 5/13/1920 which states that: "Frank Eggleston is building a new home on Walnut Street."
- This property is outside the boundaries of the National Register of Historic Places Chagrin Falls West Side District, which has a period of significance of 1845-1900. A call to the Ohio Historic Preservation Office confirms that the original district boundaries have not changed since its original listing in the National Register of Historic Places (1973).
- The present one-story, wood-frame house, with its long, narrow plan and exposed gable end beams facing the street is characteristic of a vernacular Craftsman-style house, but the Colonial Revival front porch is either an eccentric original feature or, more likely, a later addition.
- The Eggleston family was important in Village history from its formative days in the mid-19th century. They owned and operated an early tavern in town, then the Eggleston House Hotel which later became the Irving House Hotel. However, this house was built well after these achievements.
- 31 Walnut Street is not listed in the National Register of Historic Places either individually or as a contributing structure within a historic district.

Conclusions and Recommendations:

- The property at 31 Walnut Street does not meet the standards of Historical Significance as defined in Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), Section 1146.05, even though it is more than 50 years old, because: a) it is not listed in the National Register of Historic Places either individually or as a contributing structure within a historic district, nor does it appear to be eligible for future listing; b) the Eggleston family connection is not directly related at this property to the historic sites associated with that family's name; and c) the house is not distinctive of local characteristics, either architecturally or structurally.
- The proposed new front porch is consistent with the Craftsman style of the house. However, I have not seen any historical documentation that would indicate that this house originally had a porch of this design.
- The proposed changes to the east and west walls of 31 Walnut Street would not cause an adverse effect to the historical significance of this house.
- The proposed changes to the east and west walls of 31 Walnut Street would not cause an adverse effect to proximate historically-significant properties.

31 Walnut Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

13415 Shaker Boulevard, Suite 11-H-4, Cleveland, OH 44120 tedsande@ameritech.net

MEMORANDUM

Date:

27 August 2013

To:

Benjamin Himes, Chief Administrative Officer, Village of Chagrin Falls,

Ohio

Subject:

122 Walnut Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

At the Village's request, as provided in Section 1146.03 (a) (2) paragraphs A and C of Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), I have conducted research on the property at 122 Walnut Street to determine its historical significance and reviewed the proposed plans for changes to it with respect to the potential impact that these changes would have upon the historical significance of this property and the immediate neighborhood in which it stands.

Sources Consulted: a) Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online; b) Ohio Historic Inventory (OHI) listings; c) Gray & Pape Photographic Survey; and d) site plan CS-1 and architectural drawings A-1 through A-3 prepared by Jansen Architecture LLC and provided by the Village Building and Zoning Department. A site visit was made on Saturday, 24 August 2013.

<u>The Issue</u>: The owner desires to add a dormer to the north side of the existing roof and internal changes in order to add a bedroom, bathroom and recreation room at the third floor level.

- 122 Walnut Street is located in the northwest corner of the intersection of Walnut and Hall Streets in an R1-50 Residential District. The property is just south of the Chagrin Falls West Side National Register District.
- The Cuyahoga County Auditor Property Information, online, dates the house to 1897 and the attached garage to 1980. However, OHI form CUY755126, prepared by Gray & Pape in 2005, confirms from historical records that the house was built in 1907 for E. J. Randolph. This form dates the attached garage to ca.1920.

- Gray & Pape classify the two-story, wood-frame house, with its steep-pitch roof, as Queen Anne, largely because of the open east front porch with its turned columns and balusters.
- The proposed new dormer window faces north and is not visible from either Walnut or Hall Streets.

Conclusions and Recommendations: The house at 122 Walnut Street meets the standards of Historical Significance as defined in Ordinance 2007-19 (as amended), Section 1146.05 because: a) it is more than 50 years old; b) it is a good example of a vernacular Queen Anne design, typical of many houses in the Village built in the late 19th and early 20th centuries; and c) it would qualify for listing in the National Register of Historic Places as a contributing structure within a potential future historic district.

- The proposed new dormer on the north slope of the existing roof would not cause an adverse effect to the historical significance of the house.
- The proposed new dormer on the north slope of the existing roof would not cause an adverse effect to proximate historically-significant properties.